

# DETECTORS: GREAT CONCEPTS AND GLORIOUS FAILURES Or: Lessons learned



Ingrid-Maria Gregor DESY/Universität Bonn EDIT School 2020

# DISCLAIMER

- Designing a particle physics detector is a very complex business
- Many very nice examples exist
- Also some examples of failures

- Idea of this talk: some stuff you don't find in textbooks
- Collection of failures might give the impression of overall incompetence
  - Overwhelming majority of detectors run like a chime
  - Unbelievable effort to get large accelerators and experiments in a global effort to run so nicely
  - Even sociologists are interested in how we do this ...

Some bias in the selection of detectors and examples based on my experience, my friends and other factors ...





### GREAT CONCEPTS ....

VI HOUET, S, C

# Some examples

3

# CURRENT HEP DETECTOR R&D

- Detector development is always an important topic in high energy physics
- Technical demands are constantly increasing due to new challenges in particle physics
  - higher occupancy, smaller feature size, larger trigger rates, radiation level, .....
- New HEP detector projects are planned for
  - Detector upgrades during different LHC phases up to HL-LHC (ATLAS, CMS, ALICE, LHCb)
  - Detector R&D for a future linear collider (ILC and CLIC)
  - Belle II (construction phase ongoing)
  - PANDA and CBM @Fair
  - .....



source: "CMS Particle Hunter"



# HOW TO DO A PARTICLE PHYSICS EXPERIMENT ?

- Ingredients needed:
  - particle source
  - accelerator and aiming device
  - detector
  - trigger
  - recording devices
- Recipe:
  - get particles (e.g. protons, antiprotons, electrons, …)
  - accelerate them
  - collide them
  - observe and record the events
  - analyse and interpret the data
  - many people to:
    - design, build, test, operate accelerate
    - design, build, test, calibrate, operate, understand the detector
    - analyse data





typical HERA collaboration: ~400 people LHC collaborations: >2000 people



BONN Ingrid-Maria Gregor - EDIT2020 - Concepts and Failures

### CONCEPTUAL DESIGN OF HEP DETECTORS

- Need detailed understanding of
  - processes you want to measure ("physics case")
  - signatures, particle energies and rates to be expected
  - background conditions
- Decide on magnetic field
  - only around tracker?
  - extending further ?
- Calorimeter choice
  - define geometry (nuclear reaction length, X0)
  - type of calorimeter (can be mixed)
  - choice of material and granularity depends also on funds



- Tracker
  - technology choice (gas and/or Si?)
  - number of layers, coverage, ...
  - pitch, thickness, ....
  - also here money plays a huge role



Detailed Monte Carlo Simulations need to guide the design process all the time !!

# A MAGNET FOR A LHC EXPERIMENT

### Wish list

- big: long lever arm for tracking
- high magnetic field
- Iow material budget or outside detector (radiation length, absorption)
- serve as mechanical support
- reliable operation
- cheap
- ....

BONN



### ATLAS decision

- achieve a high-precision stand-alone momentum measurement of muons
- need magnetic field in muon region -> large radius magnet

### CMS decision

• single magnet with the highest possible field in inner tracker (momentum resolution)

∆p<sub>T</sub>/p<sub>T</sub> ≈ 1/BL<sup>2</sup>

• muon detector outside of magnet



### MAGNET-CONCEPTS: ATLAS -> TOROID





- Central toroid field outside the calorimeter within muonsystem: <4 T</p>
  - Closed field, no yoke
  - Complex field
- Thin-walled 2 T Solenoid-field for trackers integrated into the cryostat of the ECAL barrel

- + field always perpendicular to  $\overrightarrow{p}$
- + relative large field over large volume
- non uniform field
- complex structure -> limited accessibility



### MAGNET-CONCEPTS: CMS -> SOLENUID





- Super-conducting, 3.8 T field inside coil
- Weaker opposite field in return yoke (2T)
- Encloses trackers and calorimeter
- 13 m long, inner radius 5.9 m, I = 20 kA, weight of coil: 220 t

- + large homogeneous field inside coil
- + weak opposite field in return yoke
- + easier to access
- size limited (cost)
- relative high material budget

# ATLAS@LHC

Example@LHC



Ingrid-Maria Gregor - EDIT2020 - Concepts and Failures

### ATLAS CROSS SECTION

### Example@LHC





# CMS@LHC



BONN Ingrid-Maria Gregor - EDIT2020 - Concepts and Failures

### CMS CROSS SECTION







Foto: CERN

### THE BIG ONES AT LHC ....



CMS

ALICE

Ingrid-Maria Gregor - EDIT2020 - Concepts and Failures

# THE H1 DETECTOR



# H1 DETECTOR

### Example@HERA







# THE ZEUS DETECTOR

Example@HERA



# ZEUS







# THE DELPHI DETECTOR



# DELPHI



### Example@LEP





Ingrid-Maria Gregor - EDIT2020 - Concepts and Failures

# THE CDF DETECTOR

Example@Tevatron





# CDF

Example@Tevatron





### THE BABAR DETECTOR



### BABAR





AMS

**AMS@ISS** 









### PROBLEMS IN OVERALL CONCEPT

V HOLET, S, C

# DO WITHOUT INNER TRACKING MAGNET

- D0 Experiment at Tevatron constructed to study protonantiproton collisions
- **Top discovery** in 1995 together with CDF experiment
- Original design for Run I: no magnet for tracking
  - "Focussing on parton jets for deciphering the underlying physics than emphasis on individual final particle after hadronisation"
  - Very compact tracking system
  - Uranium-liquid argon calorimeter for identification of electrons, photons, jets and muons
- Effect of low momentum charged particles greatly underestimated resulting in analysis difficulties.

Run II system included a silicon microstrip tracker and a scintillating-fibre tracker located within a 2 T solenoidal magnet.





# ZEUS TRD

BONN

### TRD see Christoph on Feb 24

- Zeus Transition Radiation detector for electron identification.
- Aim: h/e rejection ratio of about 10<sup>-2</sup> for electron tracks embedded in jets (1 - 30 GeV/c).
- However central tracking detector (wire chamber) had 2cm end-plate for wire fixation
  - Electrons 100% probability to shower and thus were not present in showers anymore
- Reason for mishap: no proper Monte Carlo simulation tools available at time of detector design

Simulate everything incl. ALL cables and mechanics

TRD used for Here Run I Replaced by Straw Tube Tracker for Run II



# HERA-B

### Would be a full lecture by itself ....

- → HERA-B started as a search for CP violation in B→J/ $\psi$ K<sub>s</sub><sup>0</sup>.
  - Fixed target hadronic b-factory
- Bad surprises:
  - Inner tracker: Microstrip gas chamber breakdowns occurred at the intolerable high rate of a few sparks per hour
  - Outer tracker: rapid ageing of chambers due to radiation environment
  - Additional R&D required for the tracking system: two year delay.
- In the mean time Belle and BaBar measured CB violation in B meson decays (ICHEP 2000)
- Decided to ramp Hera-B slowly down .....







Frontier detector technology: microstrip gas chambers

http://www-hera-b.desy.de/general/info/CERN-Seminar.pdf

# REASONS

- Very challenging particle physics experiment
  - Particle flux in detector
  - Radiation damage
  - Event rate
  - Data throughput

03/03/03 06:10

Comment from SG, UH Arriving at Hall West at 6:00, we don't see anybody around. The control room is dark and locked, and the HERA display announces "SHUTDOWN" (sounds a bit like Genesis 1,1, but that was a beginning...)

### 03/03/03 07:16 8

### **Comment from Bernhard Schmidt** ... in fact, at 6:45 the darkness was quite complete. And nobody around to say goodbye ... Sleep well, old lady ;-)

### Not all bad ....

- More than 100 Phd theses
- Most technical challenges solved
- CMS changed tracking design

- Hera-B was a "flip/flop" experiment
  - Only one physics measurement: CP violation in B decays
  - No backup plan for reduced requirements
- Schedule from the start very tight in light of a challenging project
  - Hera-B: LHC detector prototype ! B-factories (e<sup>+</sup>e<sup>-</sup>) BarBar (SLAC) and BELLE (KEK) in construction
  - Competing with B-factories: HERA-B without a chance

### 2002 : CP-Verletzung mit > 5 $\sigma$ gemessen



# LIQUID SCINTILLATOR CALORIMETER UA

- UA1 experiment at SPS to discover the W and Z boson
  - Very successful experiment per say



- UA1 decided to built a Uranium-Liquid scintillator calorimeter
  - Uranium: Compact enough to replace the lead-scintillator calorimeter.
  - Liquid-scintillator: tetramethylpentane (TMP) at room temperature (no cryo)
  - Challenging calorimeter concept and cost intensive ...
- Unfortunately severe difficulties were encountered in the production of clean and planar boxes filled with TMP and the project was cancelled.

see Stefan on Feb 28

BONN



### http://www.roma1.infn.it/~lacava/UA1\_Experiment.pdf

http://cdsweb.cern.ch/record/197057/files/198905600.pdf

Ingrid-Maria Gregor - EDIT2020 - Concepts and Failures

## **UNEXPECTED IRRADIATION FAILURE**

VI FIDET, S, C

# PROBLEM: RADIATION DAMAGE

### see Poris on Feb 17 and Norbert on Feb 19

- Radiation damages the silicon on atomic level significantly leading to macroscopic effects.
- Surface effects: Generation of charge traps due to ionising energy loss — Total ionising dose, TID (problem for sensors and readout electronics ).
  - Cumulative long term trapping of positive charge
  - Increase of leakage current and oxide breakdown



```
STI = shallow trench interface
```

- Bulk effects: displacement damage and build up of crystal defects due to non ionising energy loss (NIEL) (main problem for sensors).
  - Unit: 1MeV equivalent n/cm<sup>2</sup>



Defects composed of: Vacancies and Interstitials

Compound defects with impuritie possible!

- Transient effects: Radiation induced errors in microelectronic circuits
  - caused by passing charged particles leaving behind a wake of electron-hole pairs
  - single event upsets, single event latch-ups, ….

Generations of scientists worked on understanding failures connected to radiation damage and how to mitigated the effects - however ...



# ATLAS BARREL TRT

### see Christoph R. on Feb 24

- Gas mixture: 70% Xe + 20  $CF_4$  + 10%  $CO_2$
- Observed: destruction of glass joint between long wires after 0.3 0.4 integrated charge (very soon after start up)



At high irradiation C<sub>4</sub>F turns partially into HF,F,F2 (hydrofluoric acid)

-> attaches Si-based materials in the detector

Changed gas mixture, after ~10 years of R&D with old mixture



### during production

Ingrid-Maria Gregor - EDIT2020 - Concepts and Failures

# CMS DC-DC CONVERTER

- During 2017 new pixel detector installed in CMS with DC-DC converter for powering
  - After a few months, about 5% of the deployed converters failed.
  - During winter shutdown another about 35% of the converters were found affected by a damage mechanism.
- Extremely difficult to identify problem over months multiple tests conducted
- Found strong correlation between radiation background and failures, as well as the functional sequence necessary for the damage to happen.
  - Damage caused by TID radiation damage opening a source-drain leakage current in **one** transistor in Feast2.1 chip
  - High-voltage transistors can not be designed in an enclosed layout to prevent this problem



### **DC-DC** in a nutshell:

transfer energy into detector with higher voltage/lower current and transform just before the load to operation voltage



Feast2

Consequences for operation
lower input voltage helps
stop disabling the output



https://project-dcdc.web.cern.ch/project-dcdc/public/Documents/ExecutiveSummary2018.pdf https://instrumentationseminar.desy.de/sites2009/site\_instrumentationseminar/content/e70397/e282395/e287407/20190614\_pixelphase1JIS.pdf

# ATLAS IBL TID BUMP

- Steep increase in power consumption of IBL during operation increasing the temperature
- Effect of total ionising dose on front-end chip FE-I4B
- Caused by the effect of TID on NMOS transistors:
  - Leakage current was induced by positive charge trapped in the bulk of the shallow trench isolation (STI)
  - Temperature and voltage depending





### Mitigation plan:

- Operating temperature was increased from −10 ∘C to and 10 ∘C then decreased to 5 ∘C.
- Digital supply-voltage was decreased to from 1.2 V 1.0 V until TID approached more than 4 MRad.

# "LOW TECH" FAILURES

WHIDET, S, C

600

# WHAT IS "LOW" TECH ?

- In particle physics experiments almost everything is high tech
  - Need extreme reliability
  - Radiation tolerance
  - Precision
  - Mostly running longer than originally planned

- However some areas considered as "low tech" and people (and funding agencies) don't like to invest research money into those areas
  - Cables for powering
  - Power plants
  - Cooling
  - Data transfer (optical and electrical)
  - Non sensitive materials (mechanics)
  - Glues





what are other words for low-tech? simple, unsophisticated, basic, dolly, foolproof, onefold, elementary, simpler, crude, rudimentary

# For particle physics experiments this is not true !



# WIRE-BONDS AND WIRE BREAKAGE

V HOET, S, C

# PROBLEMS WITH WIRE BONDS (CDF, DO)

- Very important connection technology for tracking detectors: wire bonds:
  - 17-20 um small wire connection -> terrible sensitive ....
- Observation: During synchronous readout conditions, loss of modules (no data, Drop in current)



- Tests revealed:
  - Bonds start moving due to Lorentz Force in magnetic field
  - Wire resonance in the 20 kHz range
  - Current is highest during data readout
  - Already a few kicks are enough to get the bond excited

Implemented "Ghostbuster" system which avoids long phases with same readout frequency

during running



# **DPAL MVD 1994**

- OPAL MVD ran for a short while without cooling water flow.
- Temperature of the detector rose to over 100°C.
  - Most of the modules to fail or to be partially damaged.
- Chain of problem causing damage:



- MVD expert modified the control/monitoring software between consecutive data taking runs.
- Inserted bug which stopped software in a state with cooling water off but with the low voltage power on.
- Stopped software also prevented the monitoring of the temperature from functioning
- Should have been prevented by additional interlock but that was also disabled....

### Lucky outcome:

- Damage was mostly melted wire bonds
- Detector could be fixed in winter shutdown

### Mitigation plan:

- new and more rigorous interlock system that could not be in a disabled state during data taking conditions.
- rule was implemented that prohibited software modifications between consecutive data taking runs.



# ATLAS IBL - WIRE BOND CORROSION

- Additional pixel layer for ATLAS installed in 2015
- Five months **before** installation: corrosion residues observed at wire-bonds after cold tests (-25 C)
  - Severe damage of many wire-bonds
- Residue showed traces of chlorine: catalyst of a reaction between Aluminium (wire-bonds) and H<sub>2</sub>O (in air)
- Origin of chlorine in system never fully understood



Stave 08

Signal A = SE2









BONN Ingrid-Maria Gregor - EDIT2020 - Concepts and Failures

Vac-Low PC-Std. 10 kV

50 µm

# MORE WIRE BOND WRECKAGE

- During CMS strip tracker production quality assurance applied before and after transport
  - Quality of wires is tested by pull tests (measured in g)
- Wire bonds were weaker after transport with plane
- Random 3.4 g NASA vibration test could reproduce same problem
- Problem observed during production -> improved by adding a glue layer
- No further problems during production









Ingrid-Maria Gregor - EDIT2020 - Concepts and Failures

# WIRES H1 CENTRAL JET CHAMBER

- Outer tracker of H1@HERA spontaneously broken wires in CJC1 observed during first shutdown (Dec 92)
- Observation / possible reason:
  - All wires broken close to wire ends
  - Remnants from gilding process of wire feed through
  - Sharp edges cause damage of gold layer on wires
  - Lead to complex chemical reactions
  - H induced brittle fracture
  - Replaced broken wires during next shutdown
  - New design of crimp tube:
    - replace brass inserts in wire feed through by jewels
    - better quality control





Ingrid-Maria Gregor - EDIT2020 - Concepts and Failures

http://www.desy.de/agingworkshop/trans/ps/niebuhr.pdf

# WIRES H1 CENTRAL JET CHAMBER

### during running



BONN

Ingrid-Maria Gregor - EDIT2020 - Concepts and Failures

- Sense Wire Deposits in outer jet chamber CJC2
- Observation / possible reason:
  - y dependence implies most likely gas impurity
  - Source of contamination not clear
  - Problem was not observed in CJC1 which had the same gas system
  - Only difference: gas ring



Sample wire with substantial deposit

### Consequences:

- sense wires replaced
- changes in gas distribution
- increased gas flow



# NOMAD DETECTOR

- NOMAD (neutrino oscillation magnetic detector) experiment which took data in the CERN wide-band neutrino beam from 1995 to 1998
- Drift-chambers: glued strip bands with adhesive technique and carefully tested this method
- After several weeks of operation suffered from short circuits in many chambers
  - Honeycomb material developed gas bubbles and came apart
  - Probably due to the moisture gradient between the outside of the chamber and the dry gas in the drift gap

### during commissioning

Repaired 25 chambers with different glue technique.







https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0168900201013717

# JADE@PETRA

### during commissioning

- Going back to 1978 …
- One of the Petra experiments (besides MARK J, PLUTO, TASSO, CELLO)
- During beam commissioning the Petra beam was dumped directly into the central jet chamber
  - too high beam current
  - damaging a number of cells
- Chambers had to be taken out and repaired

Reinstallation and commissioning still in time to be part of t gluon discovery in 1979







# COOLING DAMAGES

VI FIDET, S, C

CCC P

# COOLING OF ZEUS STRAW TUBE TRACKER (STT)

- After an upgrade of the on-board electronics, the STT caused instabilities of the insulation vacuum of the ZEUS Magnet
- FDET cooling is insufficient (thermal contact between electronics and cooling)
  - Heating of inner cylinder of solenoid (1 kW cooling power missing)



Solution
Winter Shutdown 2005/06: removal of STT with special Jig
Add cooling on STT

Exchange and re-tighten all screws of the end-flange of the ZEUS magnet



# CMS WATER LEAK

- In October 2009 a sever water leak was observed in the CMS experiment
- An initially small leak dramatically worsened, about 100 litres of water were released affecting several subsystems.

- Cause: Stress corrosion phenomenon due to
  - geometry of the bushing (very thin section)
  - probable over-tightening
  - type of alloy used, particularly susceptible to stress corrosion cracking

# during commissioning

# 

### Repair during winter shutdown:

396 bushings changed and some collateral damage repaired

# WATER DAMAGE IN TRACKER ...

- H1@HERA FST in 2004
- Imperfect crimp + hardening of plastic (age, irradiation) => water leak
- Water condensation => damage
- Tracker segment had to be rebuilt







# ATLAS PIXEL TUBE CORROSION

### during production

- Cooling tube of current pixel layers were supposed to be very light in material
  - Bare pipe material (AI)
  - Ni plating used to allow for brazing of the pipe fittings
  - No proper drying procedure  $\rightarrow$  water
- Water triggered corrosion process in the aluminium pipes.
  - Corrosion was due to galvanic process where water and traces of halogen (like CI) acted as electrolyte.
  - Effect of the galvanic corrosion led in some cases to holes in the pipe.







### Six months delay in schedule

- Repair the 43 loaded staves with a pipe-inside-the-pipe
- Production of new staves with new Al compound and laser welding
- Repair of bare staves (~100)

# ZEUS CALORIMETER - ONE MORE WATER LEAK

- Micro hole in copper hose led to water in the digital card crates
- Four crates were affected, but only seven cards were really showing traces of water



Where ever you chose to cool with a liquid - it will leak one day !



Of course this all happened on a Saturday morning at 5am ....



# OTHER PROBLEMS AND FAMOUS PROBLEMS

# ATLAS IBL STAVE BOW

during commissioning

see Petra on Feb 25

- Distortion depending on the operating temperature was observed.
- Caused by a mismatch between the coefficients of thermal expansion (CTE) of a bare stave made with the carbon foam and the flex attached on the bare stave.
- Maximum more than 300 µm at -20 °C with respect to the nominal position at the room temperature.





Mitigated by temperature control at the level of 0.2 K and the regular alignment correction in the offline reconstruction



# CABLE PROBLEM WITH PRESS COVERAGE

- Oscillation Project with Emulsion-tRacking Apparatus OPERA: instrument for detecting tau neutrinos from muon neutrino oscillations
- In 2011 they observed neutrinos appearing to travel faster than light.
  - Very controversial paper also within collaboration

### The top 10 biggest science stories of the decade

- Kink from a GPS receiver to OPERA master clock was loose
  - Increased the delay through the fibre resulting in decreasing the reported flight time of the neutrinos by 73 ns,
  - making them seem faster than light.

After finding the problem, the difference between the measured and expected arrival time of neutrinos was approximately  $6.5 \pm 15$  ns.







# MAYBE MOST FAMOUS DAMAGE ....

- Underground water Cherenkov detector with 50,000 tons of ultrapure water as target material
- Nov 2001: One PMT imploded creating shock wave destroying about 7700 of PMTs



- Detector was partially restored by redistributing the photomultiplier tubes which did not implode.
- Eventually added new reinforced PMTs



### during commissioning



# CONCLUSIONS

- Large detectors are typically build up in layers
  - Inner tracking: momentum measurement using a B-field
  - Outside calorimeter: energy measurement by total absorption
  - Many factors play a role in the overall concept
- Many different technologies:
  - Gas- and semiconductors (light material) for tracking
  - Sampling and Homogeneous calorimeters for energy measurement
- A lot of effort and good ideas are put into the main detecting technologies to develop cutting-edge detectors for the next generation particle physics experiments





### BUT: the devil sits in the details

# LESSONS LEARNED ?

- Spend enough time on simulating all aspects of your detector with ALL materials implemented
- Don't underestimate the "low tech"
  - Cables
  - Cooling
  - Mechanics including FEA
  - Radiation damage of non-sensitive materials
  - .....

. . . . .

- Make sure the overall timeline is not completely crazy (tough job)
- When mixing materials ask a chemist once in a while
- Better is the enemy of good enough (Marty Breidenbach)

Solving and preventing theses kind of problems is also part of the fascination of detector physics!!



info@mool.in



"To succeed planning alone is insufficient. One must improvise as well."

Isaac Asimov





# TID BUMP

**Surface effects:** Generation of charge traps due to ionising energy loss (Total ionising dose, TID) (main problem for electronics).

- The leakage current is the sum of different mechanisms involving:
  - the creation/trapping of charge (by radiation)
  - its passivation/de-trapping (by thermal excitation)
- These phenomena are dose rate and temperature dependent!
- Charge trapped in the STI oxide
  - +Q charge
  - Fast creation
  - Annealing already at T<sub>amb</sub>
- Interface states at STI-Silicon interface
  - -Q for NMOS, +Q for PMOS
  - Slow creation
  - Annealing starts at 80-100C





STI = shallow trench interface

irradiation

irradiation

STI

not to