

Local subtraction at NNLO

Sandro Uccirati

University of Torino - INFN Torino

In collaboration with:

Gloria Bertolotti, Lorenzo Magnea, Ezio Maina,

Giovanni Pelliccioli, Chiara Signorile, Paolo Torrielli



A Loop Summit 2021



LHC is ...

- a hadron machine → QCD-based processes
- a high-energy machine → complex processes
- entering a high-precision phase → theory must follow
- searching new physics → must control SM background

High precision computation in QCD needed

- PDFs, resummation, parton shower, hadronization and ...
- ... fixed order computations

Ambitious goal: Automatic NNLO QCD computations

- Loop computations and ...
- ... cancellation of soft and collinear singularities → this talk

Well established subtraction schemes at NLO

- Frixione-Kunst-Signer (FKS) subtraction
- Catani-Seymour (CS) Dipole subtraction
- Nagy-Soper subtraction

Frixione, Kunszt, Signer
Catani, Seymour
Nagy, Soper

Many methods available at NNLO

- Antenna subtraction Gehrmann De Ridder, Gehrmann, Glover, Heinrich, et al.
- CoLoRFul subtraction Del Duca, Duhr, Kardos, Somogyi, Troscanyi, et al.
- Sector-improved residue subtraction Czakon et al.
- Nested soft-collinear subtraction Melnikov et al.
- Local analytic sector subtraction Magnea, Maina, Torrielli, U. et al.
- qT-slicing Catani, Grazzini, et al.
- N-jettiness slicing Boughezal, Petriello, et al.
- Projection to Born Cacciari, Salam, Zanderighi, et al.
- Sector decomposition Anastasiou, Binoth, et al.
- ε -prescription Frixione, Grazzini
- Unsubtraction Rodrigo et al.
- Geometric Herzog

Well established subtraction schemes at NLO

- Frixione-Kunst-Signer (FKS) subtraction Frixione, Kunszt, Signer
- Catani-Seymour (CS) Dipole subtraction Catani, Seymour
- Nagy-Soper subtraction Nagy, Soper

Many methods available at NNLO

- Antenna subtraction Gehrmann De Ridder, Gehrmann, Glover, Heinrich, et al.
- CoLoRFul subtraction Del Duca, Duhr, Kardos, Somogyi, Troscanyi, et al.
- Sector-improved residue subtraction Czakon et al.
- Nested soft-collinear subtraction Melnikov et al.
- Local analytic sector subtraction Magnea, Maina, Torrielli, U. et al.
- qT-slicing Catani, Grazzini, et al.
- N-jettiness slicing Boughezal, Petriello, et al.
- Projection to Born Cacciari, Salam, Zanderighi, et al.
- Sector decomposition Anastasiou, Binoth, et al.
- ε -prescription Frixione, Grazzini
- Unsubtraction Rodrigo et al.
- Geometric Herzog

Structure of subtraction at NNLO

$$\frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} = \int d\Phi_n VV \delta_{X_n} + \int d\Phi_{n+1} RV \delta_{X_{n+1}} + \int d\Phi_{n+2} RR \delta_{X_{n+2}}$$

V and RV have poles in ϵ , RV and RR diverge in phase space

Structure of subtraction at NNLO

$$\frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} = \int d\Phi_n VV \delta_{X_n} + \int d\Phi_{n+1} RV \delta_{X_{n+1}} + \int d\Phi_{n+2} RR \delta_{X_{n+2}}$$

V and *RV* have poles in ϵ , *RV* and *RR* diverge in phase space

Let's insert counterterms !

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} &= \int d\Phi_n \left(VV \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} \right] \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} \right] \end{aligned}$$

Structure of subtraction at NNLO

$$\frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} = \int d\Phi_n VV \delta_{X_n} + \int d\Phi_{n+1} RV \delta_{X_{n+1}} + \int d\Phi_{n+2} RR \delta_{X_{n+2}}$$

V and RV have poles in ϵ , RV and RR diverge in phase space

Let's insert counterterms !

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} &= \int d\Phi_n \left(VV \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ &+ \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} \right] \\ &+ \boxed{\int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} \right]} \quad \text{Counterterms for } RR \end{aligned}$$

Counterterms for RR

Counterterms for RR

- Partition of phase space through sector functions

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \frac{\sigma_{ijkl}}{\sigma}$$

$$\sigma_{ijkl} = \frac{1}{(\mathcal{E}_i w_{ij})^\alpha} \frac{1}{(\mathcal{E}_k + \delta_{kj} \mathcal{E}_i) w_{kl}} \quad \alpha > 1$$

$$\sigma = \sum_{\substack{i, j \neq i \\ k \neq i, l \neq i, k}} \sigma_{ijkl}$$

$$\sum_{i, j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i, k}} \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = 1$$

$$RR = \sum_{i, j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i, k}} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

\mathcal{E}_i \longrightarrow (adimensional) energy of particle i

$w_{ij} = \frac{1 - \cos \theta_{ij}}{2}, \quad \theta_{ij} \longrightarrow$ angle between particles i and j

Counterterms for RR

- Partition of phase space through sector functions

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \frac{\sigma_{ijkl}}{\sigma}$$

$$\sigma_{ijkl} = \frac{1}{(\mathcal{E}_i w_{ij})^\alpha} \frac{1}{(\mathcal{E}_k + \delta_{kj} \mathcal{E}_i) w_{kl}} \quad \alpha > 1$$

$$\sigma = \sum_{\substack{i, j \neq i \\ k \neq i, l \neq i, k}} \sigma_{ijkl}$$

$$\sum_{i, j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i, k}} \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = 1$$

$$RR = \sum_{i, j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i, k}} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

In each sector "**few**" singular limits survive

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijjk} : \mathbf{S}_i \quad \mathbf{C}_{ij} \quad \mathbf{S}_{ij} \quad \mathbf{C}_{ijk} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{ijk}$$

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkj} : \mathbf{S}_i \quad \mathbf{C}_{ij} \quad \mathbf{S}_{ik} \quad \mathbf{C}_{ijk} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{ijk} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{kij}$$

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkl} : \mathbf{S}_i \quad \mathbf{C}_{ij} \quad \mathbf{S}_{ik} \quad \mathbf{C}_{ijkl} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{ikl} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{kij}$$

Counterterms for RR

- Partition of phase space through sector functions

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \frac{\sigma_{ijkl}}{\sigma}$$

$$\sigma_{ijkl} = \frac{1}{(\mathcal{E}_i w_{ij})^\alpha} \frac{1}{(\mathcal{E}_k + \delta_{kj} \mathcal{E}_i) w_{kl}} \quad \alpha > 1$$

$$\sigma = \sum_{\substack{i, j \neq i \\ k \neq i, l \neq i, k}} \sigma_{ijkl}$$

In each sector „

$$\mathbf{S}_i : \mathcal{E}_i \rightarrow 0$$

$$\mathbf{C}_{ij} : w_{ij} \rightarrow 0$$

$$\mathbf{S}_{ij} : \mathcal{E}_i, \mathcal{E}_j \rightarrow 0 \text{ uniformly}$$

$$\mathbf{C}_{ijk} : w_{ij}, w_{jk}, w_{ik} \rightarrow 0 \text{ uniformly}$$

$$\mathbf{C}_{ijkl} : w_{ij}, w_{kl} \rightarrow 0 \text{ uniformly}$$

$$\mathbf{SC}_{ijk} : \mathcal{E}_i, w_{jk} \rightarrow 0 \text{ uniformly}$$

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijjk}$$

$$: \quad \mathbf{S}_i \quad \mathbf{C}_{ij}$$

$$\mathbf{S}_{ij} \quad \mathbf{C}_{ijk} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{ijk}$$

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkj}$$

$$: \quad \mathbf{S}_i \quad \mathbf{C}_{ij}$$

$$\mathbf{S}_{ik} \quad \mathbf{C}_{ijk} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{ijk} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{kij}$$

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

$$: \quad \mathbf{S}_i \quad \mathbf{C}_{ij}$$

$$\mathbf{S}_{ik} \quad \mathbf{C}_{ijkl} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{ikl} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{kij}$$



1-unresolved limits



2-unresolved limits

Counterterms for RR

- Partition of phase space through sector functions

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \frac{\sigma_{ijkl}}{\sigma}$$

$$\sigma_{ijkl} = \frac{1}{(\mathcal{E}_i w_{ij})^\alpha} \frac{1}{(\mathcal{E}_k + \delta_{kj} \mathcal{E}_i) w_{kl}} \quad \alpha > 1$$

$$\sigma = \sum_{\substack{i, j \neq i \\ k \neq i, l \neq i, k}} \sigma_{ijkl}$$

In each sector „

$$\mathbf{S}_i : \mathcal{E}_i \rightarrow 0$$

$$\mathbf{C}_{ij} : w_{ij} \rightarrow 0$$

$$\mathbf{S}_{ij} : \mathcal{E}_i, \mathcal{E}_j \rightarrow 0 \text{ uniformly}$$

$$\mathbf{C}_{ijk} : w_{ij}, w_{jk}, w_{ij} \rightarrow 0 \text{ uniformly}$$

$$\mathbf{C}_{ijkl} : w_{ij}, w_{kl} \rightarrow 0 \text{ uniformly}$$

$$\mathbf{SC}_{ijk} : \mathcal{E}_i, w_{jk} \rightarrow 0 \text{ uniformly}$$

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijjk}$$

$$: \quad \mathbf{S}_i \quad \mathbf{C}_{ij}$$

$$\mathbf{S}_{ij} \quad \mathbf{C}_{ijk} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{ijk}$$

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkj}$$

$$: \quad \mathbf{S}_i \quad \mathbf{C}_{ij}$$

$$\mathbf{S}_{ik} \quad \mathbf{C}_{ijk} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{ijk} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{kij}$$

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

$$: \quad \mathbf{S}_i \quad \mathbf{C}_{ij}$$

$$\mathbf{S}_{ik} \quad \mathbf{C}_{ijkl} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{ikl} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{kij}$$

1-unresolved limits

2-unresolved limits

ALL limits
commute

Counterterms for RR

- Partition of phase space through sector functions

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \frac{\sigma_{ijkl}}{\sigma}$$

$$\sigma_{ijkl} = \frac{1}{(\mathcal{E}_i w_{ij})^\alpha} \frac{1}{(\mathcal{E}_k + \delta_{kj} \mathcal{E}_i) w_{kl}} \quad \alpha > 1$$

$$\sigma = \sum_{\substack{i, j \neq i \\ k \neq i, l \neq i, k}} \sigma_{ijkl}$$

$$\sum_{i, j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i, k}} \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = 1$$

$$RR = \sum_{i, j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i, k}} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

In each sector "few" singular limits survive

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijjk} :$$

$$\begin{matrix} S_i & C_{ij} \end{matrix}$$

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkj} :$$

$$\begin{matrix} S_i & C_{ij} \end{matrix}$$

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkl} :$$

$$\begin{matrix} S_i & C_{ij} \end{matrix}$$

$$\begin{matrix} S_{ij} & C_{ijk} & SC_{ijk} \end{matrix}$$

$$\begin{matrix} S_{ik} & C_{ijk} & SC_{ijk} & SC_{kij} \end{matrix}$$

$$\begin{matrix} S_{ik} & C_{ijkl} & SC_{ikl} & SC_{kij} \end{matrix}$$

*ALL limits
commute*

Get rid of sector functions for analytical integration !!

Sum rules

- Partition of phase space

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \frac{\sigma_{ijkl}}{\sigma}$$

$$\sigma = \sum_{\substack{i, j \neq i \\ k \neq i, l \neq i, k}} \sigma_{ijkl}$$

In each sector "few"

\mathcal{W}_{ijjk}	:	S_i	C_{ijk}
\mathcal{W}_{ijkj}	:	S_i	C_{ijk}
\mathcal{W}_{ijkl}	:	S_i	C_{ijkl}

$$S_{ik} \left(\sum_{j \neq i} \sum_{l \neq i, k} \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} + \sum_{j \neq k} \sum_{l \neq i, k} \mathcal{W}_{kjl} \right) = 1$$

$$C_{ijk} (\mathcal{W}_{ijjk} + \mathcal{W}_{ikkj}) + \text{perm. of } i, j, k = 1$$

$$S_{ik} C_{ijk} (\mathcal{W}_{ikkj} + \mathcal{W}_{kiji} + \mathcal{W}_{ijkj} + \mathcal{W}_{kjij}) = 1$$

$$C_{ijkl} (\mathcal{W}_{ijkl} + \mathcal{W}_{ijlk} + \mathcal{W}_{jikl} + \mathcal{W}_{jilk} + \mathcal{W}_{klij} + \mathcal{W}_{klji} + \mathcal{W}_{lkij} + \mathcal{W}_{lkji}) = 1$$

$$S_{ik} C_{ijkl} (\mathcal{W}_{ijkl} + \mathcal{W}_{klij}) = 1$$

$$C_{ijkl} S C_{ikl} (\mathcal{W}_{ijkl} + \mathcal{W}_{ijlk} + \mathcal{W}_{klij} + \mathcal{W}_{lkij}) = 1$$

$$S C_{ijk} \left(\sum_{l \neq i} \mathcal{W}_{iljk} + \sum_{l \neq i} \mathcal{W}_{ilkj} + \sum_{l \neq i, j} \mathcal{W}_{jkil} + \sum_{l \neq i, k} \mathcal{W}_{kjil} \right) = 1$$

$$S_{ik} S C_{ijk} \left(\sum_{l \neq i} \mathcal{W}_{ilkj} + \sum_{l \neq i, k} \mathcal{W}_{kjil} \right) = 1$$

$$C_{ijk} S C_{ijk} (\mathcal{W}_{ijjk} + \mathcal{W}_{ijkj} + \mathcal{W}_{ikkj} + \mathcal{W}_{ikjk} + \mathcal{W}_{jkik} + \mathcal{W}_{kjij}) = 1$$

$$S_{ik} C_{ijk} S C_{ijk} (\mathcal{W}_{ijkj} + \mathcal{W}_{ikkj} + \mathcal{W}_{kjij}) = 1$$

Get rid of sector functions for analytical integration !!

comment

Counterterms for RR

- Partition of phase space through sector functions

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijjk} : \boxed{\mathbf{S}_i \quad \mathbf{C}_{ij}}$$

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkj} : \boxed{\mathbf{S}_i \quad \mathbf{C}_{ij}}$$

$$\mathcal{W}_{ijkl} : \boxed{\mathbf{S}_i \quad \mathbf{C}_{ij}}$$

$$\mathbf{S}_{ij} \quad \mathbf{C}_{ijk} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{ijk}$$

$$\mathbf{S}_{ik} \quad \mathbf{C}_{ijk} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{ijk} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{kij}$$

$$\mathbf{S}_{ik} \quad \mathbf{C}_{ijkl} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{ikl} \quad \mathbf{SC}_{kij}$$

$$RR = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

ALL Limits
commute

Counterterms for RR

- Partition of phase space through sector functions

\mathcal{W}_{ijjk}	:	$S_i \quad C_{ij}$	$S_{ij} \quad C_{ijk} \quad SC_{ijk}$
\mathcal{W}_{ijkj}	:	$S_i \quad C_{ij}$	$S_{ik} \quad C_{ijk} \quad SC_{ijk} \quad SC_{kij}$
\mathcal{W}_{ijkl}	:	$S_i \quad C_{ij}$	$S_{ik} \quad C_{ijkl} \quad SC_{ikl} \quad SC_{kij}$

$$RR = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

ALL Limits
commute

- Identify counterterms through IR limits

$$(1 - S_i)(1 - C_{ij})(1 - S_{ij})(1 - C_{ijk})(1 - SC_{ijk})RR \mathcal{W}_{ijjk} = \text{finite}$$

$$(1 - S_i)(1 - C_{ij})(1 - S_{ik})(1 - C_{ijk})(1 - SC_{ijk})(1 - SC_{kij})RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkj} = \text{finite}$$

$$(1 - S_i)(1 - C_{ij})(1 - S_{ik})(1 - C_{ijkl})(1 - SC_{ikl})(1 - SC_{kij})RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \text{finite}$$

Counterterms for RR

- Partition of phase space through sector functions

$$RR = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

\mathcal{W}_{ijjk}	$S_i \quad C_{ij}$	$S_{ij} \quad C_{ijk} \quad SC_{ijk}$
\mathcal{W}_{ijkj}	$S_i \quad C_{ij}$	$S_{ik} \quad C_{ijk} \quad SC_{ijk} \quad SC_{kij}$
\mathcal{W}_{ijkl}	$S_i \quad C_{ij}$	$S_{ik} \quad C_{ijkl} \quad SC_{ikl} \quad SC_{kij}$

ALL Limits
commute

- Identify counterterms through IR limits

$$(1 - S_i)(1 - C_{ij})(1 - S_{ij})(1 - C_{ijk})(1 - SC_{ijk})RR \mathcal{W}_{ijjk} = \text{finite}$$

$$1 - L_{ijjk}^{(2)}$$

$$(1 - S_i)(1 - C_{ij})(1 - S_{ik})(1 - C_{ijk})(1 - SC_{ijk})(1 - SC_{kij})RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkj} = \text{finite}$$

$$1 - L_{ijkj}^{(2)}$$

$$(1 - S_i)(1 - C_{ij})(1 - S_{ik})(1 - C_{ijkl})(1 - SC_{ikl})(1 - SC_{kij})RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \text{finite}$$

$$1 - L_{ijl}^{(1)}$$

$$1 - L_{ijkl}^{(2)}$$

Counterterms for RR

- Partition of phase space through sector functions

$$RR = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

\mathcal{W}_{ijjk}	$S_i \quad C_{ij}$	$S_{ij} \quad C_{ijk} \quad SC_{ijk}$
\mathcal{W}_{ijkj}	$S_i \quad C_{ij}$	$S_{ik} \quad C_{ijk} \quad SC_{ijk} \quad SC_{kij}$
\mathcal{W}_{ijkl}	$S_i \quad C_{ij}$	$S_{ik} \quad C_{ijkl} \quad SC_{ikl} \quad SC_{kij}$

ALL Limits
commute

- Identify counterterms through IR limits

$$(1 - S_i)(1 - C_{ij})(1 - S_{ij})(1 - C_{ijk})(1 - SC_{ijk})RR \mathcal{W}_{ijjk} = \text{finite}$$

$$1 - L_{ijjk}^{(2)}$$

$$(1 - S_i)(1 - C_{ij})(1 - S_{ik})(1 - C_{ijk})(1 - SC_{ijk})(1 - SC_{kij})RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkj} = \text{finite}$$

$$1 - L_{ijkj}^{(2)}$$

$$(1 - S_i)(1 - C_{ij})(1 - S_{ik})(1 - C_{ijkl})(1 - SC_{ikl})(1 - SC_{kij})RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \text{finite}$$

$$1 - L_{ij}^{(1)}$$

$$1 - L_{ijkl}^{(2)}$$

$$(1 - L_{ij}^{(1)}) (1 - L_{ijkl}^{(2)}) RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = [RR - L_{ij}^{(1)} RR - L_{ijkl}^{(2)} RR + L_{ij}^{(1)} L_{ijkl}^{(2)} RR] \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \text{finite}$$

Counterterms for RR

- Partition of phase space through sector functions
- Identify counterterms through IR limits

$$RR = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

$$\left(1 - \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)}\right) \left(1 - \mathbf{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)}\right) RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \boxed{[RR - \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)}RR - \mathbf{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)}RR + \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)}\mathbf{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)}RR] \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}} = \text{finite}$$

Counterterms for RR

- Partition of phase space through sector functions
- Identify counterterms through IR limits

$$RR = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

$$(1 - L_{ij}^{(1)}) (1 - L_{ijkl}^{(2)}) RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = [RR - L_{ij}^{(1)} RR - L_{ijkl}^{(2)} RR + L_{ij}^{(1)} L_{ijkl}^{(2)} RR] \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \text{finite}$$

- Remapping of momenta

- * to have momentum-conserving and on-shell momenta in matrix elements of counterterms
- * to have factorisation of $(n+2)$ phase space

$$L_{ij}^{(1)}, L_{ijkl}^{(2)}, L_{ij}^{(1)} L_{ijkl}^{(2)}$$



$$\bar{L}_{ij}^{(1)}, \bar{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)}, \bar{L}_{ij}^{(1)} \bar{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)}$$

Barred Limits = Limits + Remapping

Counterterms for RR

- Partition of phase space through sector functions
- Identify counterterms through IR limits

$$RR = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

$$(1 - \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)}) (1 - \mathbf{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)}) RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = [RR - \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)} RR - \mathbf{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)} RR + \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)} \mathbf{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)} RR] \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \text{finite}$$

- Remapping of momenta **DELICATE !!!**

- * to have momentum-conserving and on-shell momenta in matrix elements of counterterms
- * to have factorisation of $(n+2)$ phase space

$$\mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)}, \mathbf{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)}, \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)} \mathbf{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)}$$



$$\bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)}, \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ijkl}^{(2)}, \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ijkl}^{(2)}$$

Barred Limits = Limits + Remapping

- * must fulfil $[RR - \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} RR - \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ijkl}^{(2)} RR + \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ijkl}^{(2)} RR] \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \text{finite}$
- * carry the **same symmetries** as unbarred limits



to use sum rules of sector functions

Counterterms for RR

- Partition of phase space through sector functions
- Identify counterterms through IR limits

$$RR = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

$$(1 - \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)}) (1 - \mathbf{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)}) RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = [RR - \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)} RR - \mathbf{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)} RR + \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)} \mathbf{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)} RR] \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \text{finite}$$

- Remapping of momenta

DELICATE !!!

NESTED CATANI-SEYMOUR REMAPPINGS

$$\{k\} \rightarrow \{\bar{k}\}^{(abc)} \rightarrow \{\bar{k}\}^{(abc,def)}$$

$$\bar{k}_b^{(abc)} = k_a + k_b - \frac{s_{ab}}{s_{ac} + s_{bc}} k_c \quad \bar{k}_c^{(abc)} = \frac{s_{abc}}{s_{ac} + s_{bc}} k_c \quad k_a \rightarrow w, y, z$$

$$d\Phi_{n+1}(\{k\}) = d\Phi_n(\{\bar{k}\}^{(abc)}) d\Phi_{\text{rad}}(\bar{s}_{bc}^{(abc)}; w, y, z)$$

$$\int d\Phi_{\text{rad}}(s; w, y, z) = N_\epsilon s^{1-\epsilon} \int_0^1 dw \int_0^1 dy \int_0^1 dz [w(1-w)]^{-\epsilon - \frac{1}{2}} [y(1-y)^2 z(1-z)]^{-\epsilon} (1-y)$$

$$s_{ab} = y \bar{s}_{bc}^{(abc)} \quad s_{ac} = z(1-y) \bar{s}_{bc}^{(abc)} \quad s_{bc} = (1-z)(1-y) \bar{s}_{bc}^{(abc)} \quad s_{cd} = (1-y) s_{cd}^{(abc)}$$

$$s_{ad} = y(1-z) s_{cd}^{(abc)} + z s_{bd}^{(abc)} - 2(1-2w) \left[yz(1-z) s_{bd}^{(abc)} s_{cd}^{(abc)} \right]^{1/2}$$

$$s_{bd} = yz s_{cd}^{(abc)} + (1-z) s_{bd}^{(abc)} + 2(1-2w) \left[yz(1-z) s_{bd}^{(abc)} s_{cd}^{(abc)} \right]^{1/2}$$

Counterterms for RR

- Partition of phase space through sector functions
- Identify counterterms through IR limits

$$RR = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

$$\left(1 - \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)}\right) \left(1 - \mathbf{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)}\right) RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \left[RR - \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)}RR - \mathbf{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)}RR + \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)}\mathbf{L}_{ijkl}^{(2)}RR\right] \mathcal{W}_{ijkl} = \text{finite}$$

- Remapping of momenta

DELICATE !!!

NESTED CATANI-SEYMOUR REMAPPINGS

$$\{k\} \rightarrow \{\bar{k}\}^{(abc)} \rightarrow \{\bar{k}\}^{(abc,def)}$$

- * simple phase-space factorisation
- * simple expressions for invariants
- * flexible → freedom in choosing (abc,def)

To give an idea ...

$$\begin{aligned}
\bar{\mathbf{S}}_{ij} RR &\equiv \frac{\mathcal{N}_1^2}{2} \sum_{\substack{c \neq i, j \\ d \neq i, j, c}} \left[\sum_{\substack{e \neq i, j, c, d \\ f \neq i, j, c, d}} \mathcal{I}_{cd}^{(i)} \mathcal{I}_{ef}^{(j)} \bar{B}_{cdef}^{(icd, jef)} + 4 \sum_{e \neq i, j, c, d} \mathcal{I}_{cd}^{(i)} \mathcal{I}_{ed}^{(j)} \bar{B}_{cded}^{(icd, jed)} \right. \\
&\quad \left. + 2 \mathcal{I}_{cd}^{(i)} \mathcal{I}_{cd}^{(j)} \bar{B}_{cdcd}^{(icd, jcd)} + \left(\mathcal{I}_{cd}^{(ij)} - \frac{1}{2} \mathcal{I}_{cc}^{(ij)} - \frac{1}{2} \mathcal{I}_{dd}^{(ij)} \right) \bar{B}_{cd}^{(ijcd)} \right] \\
\bar{\mathbf{S}}_i \bar{\mathbf{S}}_{ij} RR &\equiv \frac{\mathcal{N}_1^2}{2} \sum_{\substack{c \neq i, j \\ d \neq i, j, c}} \left[\sum_{\substack{e \neq i, j, c, d \\ f \neq i, j, c, d, e}} \mathcal{I}_{cd}^{(i)} \bar{\mathcal{I}}_{ef}^{(j)(icd)} B_{cdef}^{(icd, jef)} \right. \\
&\quad + 2 \sum_{e \neq i, j, c, d} \mathcal{I}_{cd}^{(i)} \bar{\mathcal{I}}_{ed}^{(j)(icd)} B_{cded}^{(icd, jed)} + 2 \sum_{e \neq i, j, c, d} \mathcal{I}_{cd}^{(i)} \bar{\mathcal{I}}_{ed}^{(j)(idc)} B_{cded}^{(idc, jed)} \\
&\quad + 2 \mathcal{I}_{cd}^{(i)} \bar{\mathcal{I}}_{cd}^{(j)(icd)} B_{cdcd}^{(icd, jcd)} \\
&\quad \left. - 2 C_A \left(\mathcal{I}_{jc}^{(i)} \bar{\mathcal{I}}_{cd}^{(j)(icj)} + \mathcal{I}_{jd}^{(i)} \bar{\mathcal{I}}_{cd}^{(j)(ijd)} - \mathcal{I}_{cd}^{(i)} \bar{\mathcal{I}}_{cd}^{(j)(icd)} \right) B_{cd}^{(ijcd)} \right]
\end{aligned}$$

They coincide in the soft limit \mathbf{S}_i

$$\mathbf{S}_i \bar{\mathbf{S}}_i \bar{\mathbf{S}}_{ij} RR = \mathbf{S}_i \bar{\mathbf{S}}_{ij} RR$$

Counterterms for RR

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} = & \int d\Phi_n \left(VV \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ & + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} \right] \\ & + \int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} - \boxed{K^{(1)}} \delta_{X_{n+1}} - \left(\boxed{K^{(2)}} + \boxed{K^{(12)}} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \end{aligned}$$

$$K^{(1)} = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

$K^{(1)}$  3 barred limits

$$K^{(2)} = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ijkl}^{(2)} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

$K^{(2)}$  11 barred limits

$$K^{(12)} = - \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ijkl}^{(2)} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

$K^{(12)}$  21 barred limits

Counterterms for RR

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} = & \int d\Phi_n \left(VV \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ & + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} \right] \\ & + \int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} - \boxed{K^{(1)}} \delta_{X_{n+1}} - \left(\boxed{K^{(2)}} + \boxed{K^{(12)}} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \end{aligned}$$

$$K^{(1)} = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

$K^{(1)}$ → 3 barred limits

$$K^{(2)} = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ijkl}^{(2)} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

$K^{(2)}$ → 11 barred limits

$$K^{(12)} = - \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sum_{\substack{k \neq i \\ l \neq i,k}} \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ijkl}^{(2)} RR \mathcal{W}_{ijkl}$$

$K^{(12)}$ → 21 barred limits

We have verified analytically that

- * Each barred limit carries the right symmetries ✓
- * $RR + K^{(1)} + K^{(2)} + K^{(12)}$ → no IR singularities ✓

verified sector
by sector

Integrated counterterms for RR

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} &= \int d\Phi_n \left(VV + I^{(2)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV + I^{(1)} \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} + I^{(12)} \right] \delta_{X_n} \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} - K^{(1)} \delta_{X_{n+1}} - \left(K^{(2)} + K^{(12)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \end{aligned}$$

$$I^{(1)} = \int d\Phi_{\text{rad}} K^{(1)}$$

- Integration of $I^{(1)}$ trivial ✓

$$I^{(12)} = \int d\Phi_{\text{rad}} K^{(12)}$$

- Integration of $I^{(12)}$ easy ✓

$$I^{(2)} = \int d\Phi_{\text{rad},2} K^{(2)}$$

- Integration of $I^{(2)}$ feasible

$$I^{(2)} = I_{\text{ss}}^{(2)} + I_{\text{hcc}}^{(2)} + I_{\text{hchc}}^{(2)} + I_{\text{hsc}}^{(2)}$$

ongoing

Integrated counterterms for RR

$$\frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} = \int d\Phi_n \left(VV + I^{(2)} \right) \delta_{X_n} + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV + I^{(1)} \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} + I^{(12)} \right] \delta_{X_n}$$

To give an idea ...

$$\begin{aligned} \int d\Phi_{\text{rad},2} \bar{\mathbf{S}}_{ij} RR &= \delta_{f_i g} \delta_{f_j g} \sum_{\substack{c \neq i, j \\ d \neq i, j, c}} \left[\frac{1}{2} \sum_{\substack{e \neq i, j, c, d \\ f \neq i, j, c, d, e}} J_{\text{s} \otimes \text{s}}^{(4)}(\bar{s}_{cd}, \bar{s}_{ef}) \bar{B}_{cdef} + 2 \sum_{e \neq i, j, c, d} J_{\text{s} \otimes \text{s}}^{(3)}(\bar{s}_{cd}, \bar{s}_{ed}) \bar{B}_{cded} \right. \\ &\quad \left. + J_{\text{s} \otimes \text{s}}^{(2)}(\bar{s}_{cd}) \bar{B}_{cdcd} - C_A J_{\text{ss}}^{(\text{gg})}(\bar{s}_{cd}) \bar{B}_{cd} \right] \\ &+ \delta_{\{f_i f_j\} \{q \bar{q}\}} \sum_{\substack{c \neq i, j \\ d \neq i, j, c}} T_R J_{\text{ss}}^{(\text{q} \bar{\text{q}})}(\bar{s}_{cd}) \bar{B}_{cd} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \int d\Phi_{\text{rad}} \bar{\mathbf{S}}_i \bar{\mathbf{S}}_{ij} RR &= \delta_{f_i g} \frac{\mathcal{N}_1}{2} \sum_{\substack{l \neq j \\ m \neq j, l}} \bar{\mathcal{I}}_{lm}^{(j)} \left[\sum_{\substack{c \neq j, l \\ d \neq j, l, c}} J_s(\bar{s}_{cd}) \bar{B}_{cdlm}^{(jlm)} + 2 \sum_{c \neq j, m} J_s(\bar{s}_{cm}) \bar{B}_{cmlm}^{(jlm)} \right. \\ &\quad \left. - 2C_A \left(J_s(\bar{s}_{jl}) + J_s(\bar{s}_{jm}) - J_s(\bar{s}_{lm}) \right) \bar{B}_{lm}^{(jlm)} \right] \end{aligned}$$

Integrated counterterms for RR

$$\frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} = \int d\Phi_n \left(VV + I^{(2)} \right) \delta_{X_n} + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV + I^{(1)} \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} + I^{(12)} \right] \delta_{X_n}$$

To give an idea ...

$$\begin{aligned} \int d\Phi_{\text{rad},2} \bar{\mathbf{S}}_{ij} RR &= \delta_{f_i g} \delta_{f_j g} \sum_{\substack{c \neq i, j \\ d \neq i, j, c}} \left[\frac{1}{2} \sum_{\substack{e \neq i, j, c, d \\ f \neq i, j, c, d, e}} J_{\text{s} \otimes \text{s}}^{(4)}(\bar{s}_{cd}, \bar{s}_{ef}) \bar{B}_{cdef} + 2 \sum_{e \neq i, j, c, d} J_{\text{s} \otimes \text{s}}^{(3)}(\bar{s}_{cd}, \bar{s}_{ed}) \bar{B}_{cded} \right. \\ &\quad \left. + J_{\text{s} \otimes \text{s}}^{(2)}(\bar{s}_{cd}) \bar{B}_{cdcd} - C_A J_{\text{ss}}^{(\text{gg})}(\bar{s}_{cd}) \bar{B}_{cd} \right] \\ &+ \delta_{\{f_i f_j\} \{q \bar{q}\}} \sum_{\substack{c \neq i, j \\ d \neq i, j, c}} T_R J_{\text{ss}}^{(\text{q} \bar{\text{q}})}(\bar{s}_{cd}) \bar{B}_{cd} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \int d\Phi_{\text{rad}} \bar{\mathbf{S}}_i \bar{\mathbf{S}}_{ij} RR &= \delta_{f_i g} \frac{\mathcal{N}_1}{2} \sum_{\substack{l \neq j \\ m \neq j, l}} \bar{\mathcal{I}}_{lm}^{(j)} \left[\sum_{\substack{c \neq j, l \\ d \neq j, l, c}} J_s(\bar{s}_{cd}) \bar{B}_{cdlm}^{(jlm)} + 2 \sum_{c \neq j, m} J_s(\bar{s}_{cm}) \bar{B}_{cmlm}^{(jlm)} \right. \\ &\quad \left. - 2C_A \left(J_s(\bar{s}_{jl}) + J_s(\bar{s}_{jm}) - J_s(\bar{s}_{lm}) \right) \bar{B}_{lm}^{(jlm)} \right] \end{aligned}$$

Integrated counterterms for RR

$$\frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} = \int d\Phi_n \left(VV + I^{(2)} \right) \delta_{X_n} + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV + I^{(1)} \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} + I^{(12)} \right] \delta_{X_n}$$

To give an idea ...

$$J_{s \otimes s}^{(4)}(s, s') = \left(\frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi}\right)^2 \left(\frac{ss'}{\mu^4}\right)^{-\epsilon} \left[\frac{1}{\epsilon^4} + \frac{4}{\epsilon^3} + \left(16 - \frac{7}{6}\pi^2\right) \frac{1}{\epsilon^2} + \left(60 - \frac{14}{3}\pi^2 - \frac{50}{3}\zeta_3\right) \frac{1}{\epsilon} + 216 - \frac{56}{3}\pi^2 - \frac{200}{3}\zeta_3 + \frac{29}{120}\pi^4 \right]$$

$$J_{s \otimes s}^{(3)}(s, s') = \left(\frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi}\right)^2 \left(\frac{ss'}{\mu^4}\right)^{-\epsilon} \left[\frac{1}{\epsilon^4} + \frac{4}{\epsilon^3} + \left(17 - \frac{4}{3}\pi^2\right) \frac{1}{\epsilon^2} + \left(70 - \frac{16}{3}\pi^2 - \frac{68}{3}\zeta_3\right) \frac{1}{\epsilon} + 284 - \frac{68}{3}\pi^2 - \frac{272}{3}\zeta_3 + \frac{13}{90}\pi^4 \right]$$

$$J_{s \otimes s}^{(2)}(s) = \left(\frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi}\right)^2 \left(\frac{s}{\mu^2}\right)^{-2\epsilon} \left[\frac{1}{\epsilon^4} + \frac{4}{\epsilon^3} + \left(18 - \frac{3}{2}\pi^2\right) \frac{1}{\epsilon^2} + \left(76 - 6\pi^2 - \frac{74}{3}\zeta_3\right) \frac{1}{\epsilon} + 312 - 27\pi^2 - \frac{308}{3}\zeta_3 + \frac{49}{120}\pi^4 \right]$$

$$J_{ss}^{(q\bar{q})}(s) = \left(\frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi}\right)^2 \left(\frac{s}{\mu^2}\right)^{-2\epsilon} \left[\frac{1}{6} \frac{1}{\epsilon^3} + \frac{17}{18} \frac{1}{\epsilon^2} + \left(\frac{116}{27} - \frac{7}{36}\pi^2\right) \frac{1}{\epsilon} + \frac{1474}{81} - \frac{131}{108}\pi^2 - \frac{19}{9}\zeta_3 \right]$$

$$\begin{aligned} J_{ss}^{(gg)}(s) = & \left(\frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi}\right)^2 \left(\frac{s}{\mu^2}\right)^{-2\epsilon} \left[\frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{\epsilon^4} + \frac{35}{12} \frac{1}{\epsilon^3} + \left(\frac{487}{36} - \frac{2}{3}\pi^2\right) \frac{1}{\epsilon^2} + \left(\frac{1562}{27} - \frac{269}{72}\pi^2 - \frac{77}{6}\zeta_3\right) \frac{1}{\epsilon} \right. \\ & \left. + \frac{19351}{81} - \frac{3829}{216}\pi^2 - \frac{1025}{18}\zeta_3 - \frac{23}{240}\pi^4 \right] \end{aligned}$$

$$J_s(s) = \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \left(\frac{s}{\mu^2}\right)^{-\epsilon} \left[\frac{1}{\epsilon^2} + \frac{2}{\epsilon} + 6 - \frac{7}{12}\pi^2 \right]$$

Integrated counterterms for RR

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} &= \int d\Phi_n \left(VV + \boxed{I^{(2)}} \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV + \boxed{I^{(1)}} \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} + \boxed{I^{(12)}} \right] \delta_{X_n} \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} - K^{(1)} \delta_{X_{n+1}} - \left(K^{(2)} + K^{(12)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right]\end{aligned}$$

We have verified analytically that

- $RV + I^{(1)}$ → no ϵ poles ✓
- $I^{(1)} + I^{(12)}$ → no IR singularities ✓

verified sector by sector

Counterterm for RV

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} &= \int d\Phi_n \left(VV + I^{(\mathbf{2})} \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV + I^{(\mathbf{1})} \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} + \left(I^{(\mathbf{12})} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} - K^{(\mathbf{1})} \delta_{X_{n+1}} - \left(K^{(\mathbf{2})} + K^{(\mathbf{12})} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right]\end{aligned}$$

Counterterm for RV

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} &= \int d\Phi_n \left(VV + I^{(2)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV + I^{(1)} \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} + \left(I^{(12)} - K^{(RV)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} - K^{(1)} \delta_{X_{n+1}} - \left(K^{(2)} + K^{(12)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right]\end{aligned}$$

The counterterm $K^{(RV)}$ must satisfy

- $RV - K^{(RV)}$  no IR singularities
- $I^{(12)} - K^{(RV)}$  no ϵ poles

Counterterm for RV

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} &= \int d\Phi_n \left(VV + I^{(2)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV + I^{(1)} \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} + \left(I^{(12)} - K^{(\mathbf{RV})} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} - K^{(1)} \delta_{X_{n+1}} - \left(K^{(2)} + K^{(12)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right]\end{aligned}$$

- Partition of phase space through sector functions

$$\mathcal{W}_{ij} = \frac{\sigma_{ij}}{\sigma} \quad \sigma_{ij} = \frac{1}{\mathcal{E}_i w_{ij}} \quad \sigma = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sigma_{ij} \quad \sum_{i,j \neq i} \mathcal{W}_{ij} = 1 \quad RV = \sum_{i,j \neq i} RV \mathcal{W}_{ij}$$

Counterterm for RV

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} &= \int d\Phi_n \left(VV + I^{(2)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV + I^{(1)} \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} + \left(I^{(12)} - K^{(\mathbf{RV})} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} - K^{(1)} \delta_{X_{n+1}} - \left(K^{(2)} + K^{(12)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \end{aligned}$$

- Partition of phase space through sector functions

$$\mathcal{W}_{ij} = \frac{\sigma_{ij}}{\sigma} \quad \sigma_{ij} = \frac{1}{\mathcal{E}_i w_{ij}} \quad \sigma = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sigma_{ij} \quad \sum_{i,j \neq i} \mathcal{W}_{ij} = 1 \quad RV = \sum_{i,j \neq i} RV \mathcal{W}_{ij}$$

- Identify counterterms through IR limits

$$(1 - \mathbf{S}_i)(1 - \mathbf{C}_{ij}) RV \mathcal{W}_{ij} = \left(RV - \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)} RV \right) \mathcal{W}_{ij} = \text{finite}$$

Counterterm for RV

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} &= \int d\Phi_n \left(VV + I^{(2)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV + I^{(1)} \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} + \left(I^{(12)} - K^{(\text{RV})} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} - K^{(1)} \delta_{X_{n+1}} - \left(K^{(2)} + K^{(12)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \end{aligned}$$

- Partition of phase space through sector functions

$$\mathcal{W}_{ij} = \frac{\sigma_{ij}}{\sigma} \quad \sigma_{ij} = \frac{1}{\mathcal{E}_i w_{ij}} \quad \sigma = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \sigma_{ij} \quad \sum_{i,j \neq i} \mathcal{W}_{ij} = 1 \quad RV = \sum_{i,j \neq i} RV \mathcal{W}_{ij}$$

- Identify counterterms through IR limits

$$(1 - \mathbf{S}_i)(1 - \mathbf{C}_{ij})RV \mathcal{W}_{ij} = \left(RV - \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)} RV \right) \mathcal{W}_{ij} = \text{finite}$$

- Remapping of momenta

$$\left(RV - \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} RV \right) \mathcal{W}_{ij} = RV \mathcal{W}_{ij} - \left[\bar{\mathbf{S}}_i RV + \bar{\mathbf{C}}_{ij}(1 - \bar{\mathbf{S}}_i) RV \right] \mathcal{W}_{ij} = \text{finite}$$

The interesting case of $\mathbf{C}_{ij} RV$

Somogyi-Trócsányi
hep-ph: 0609043

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{C}_{ij} RV &= \frac{\mathcal{N}_1}{s_{ij}} \left[P_{ij}^{\mu\nu} V_{\mu\nu}(\{k\}_{[ij]}) + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \Gamma_\epsilon \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \hat{P}_{ij}^{\mu\nu} B_{\mu\nu}(\{k\}_{[ij]}) \right] - \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\beta_0}{2\epsilon} \mathbf{C}_{ij} R \\ &\quad + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\Gamma_\epsilon}{\epsilon^2} \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \left[C_{f_{[ij]}} - C_{f_i} - C_{f_j} + F_i (C_{f_{[ij]}} + C_{f_i} - C_{f_j}) + F_j (C_{f_{[ij]}} - C_{f_i} + C_{f_j}) \right] \mathbf{C}_{ij} R \end{aligned}$$

$$(1 - \mathbf{S}_i)(1 - \boxed{\mathbf{C}_{ij}}) RV \mathcal{W}_{ij} = (RV - \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)} RV) \mathcal{W}_{ij} = \text{finite}$$

- Remapping of momenta

$$(RV - \overline{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} RV) \mathcal{W}_{ij} = RV \mathcal{W}_{ij} - [\overline{\mathbf{S}}_i RV + \overline{\mathbf{C}}_{ij}(1 - \overline{\mathbf{S}}_i) RV] \mathcal{W}_{ij} = \text{finite}$$

The interesting case of $\mathbf{C}_{ij} RV$

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbf{C}_{ij} RV &= \frac{\mathcal{N}_1}{s_{ij}} \left[P_{ij}^{\mu\nu} V_{\mu\nu}(\{k\}_{[ij]}) + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \Gamma_\epsilon \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \hat{P}_{ij}^{\mu\nu} B_{\mu\nu}(\{k\}_{[ij]}) \right] - \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\beta_0}{2\epsilon} \mathbf{C}_{ij} R \\ &\quad + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\Gamma_\epsilon}{\epsilon^2} \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \left[C_{f_{[ij]}} - C_{f_i} - C_{f_j} + F_i (C_{f_{[ij]}} + C_{f_i} - C_{f_j}) + F_j (C_{f_{[ij]}} - C_{f_i} + C_{f_j}) \right] \mathbf{C}_{ij} R\end{aligned}$$

Alternative formulation \rightarrow more appropriate to match $I^{(12)} \epsilon$ poles

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbf{C}_{ij} RV &= \frac{\mathcal{N}_1}{s_{ij}} \left[P_{ij}^{\mu\nu} V_{\mu\nu}(\{k\}_{[ij]}) + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \Gamma_\epsilon \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \hat{P}_{ij}^{\mu\nu} B_{\mu\nu}(\{k\}_{[ij]}) \right] - \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\beta_0}{2\epsilon} \mathbf{C}_{ij} R \\ &\quad + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\Gamma_\epsilon}{\epsilon^2} \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \left[2 \mathbf{C}_{ij} R_{ij} - 2 \sum_{c \neq i,j} \left(F_i \mathbf{C}_{ij} R_{ic} + F_j \mathbf{C}_{ij} R_{jc} \right) \right]\end{aligned}$$

Confirmed by
factorisation

$$(1 - \mathbf{S}_i)(1 - \boxed{\mathbf{C}_{ij}} RV) \mathcal{W}_{ij} = (RV - \mathbf{L}_{ij}^{(1)} RV) \mathcal{W}_{ij} = \text{finite}$$

- Remapping of momenta

$$(RV - \overline{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} RV) \mathcal{W}_{ij} = RV \mathcal{W}_{ij} - [\overline{\mathbf{S}}_i RV + \overline{\mathbf{C}}_{ij}(1 - \overline{\mathbf{S}}_i) RV] \mathcal{W}_{ij} = \text{finite}$$

The interesting case of $\mathbf{C}_{ij} RV$

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbf{C}_{ij} RV &= \frac{\mathcal{N}_1}{s_{ij}} \left[P_{ij}^{\mu\nu} V_{\mu\nu}(\{k\}_{[ij]}) + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \Gamma_\epsilon \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \hat{P}_{ij}^{\mu\nu} B_{\mu\nu}(\{k\}_{[ij]}) \right] - \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\beta_0}{2\epsilon} \mathbf{C}_{ij} R \\ &\quad + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\Gamma_\epsilon}{\epsilon^2} \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \left[C_{f_{[ij]}} - C_{f_i} - C_{f_j} + F_i (C_{f_{[ij]}} + C_{f_i} - C_{f_j}) + F_j (C_{f_{[ij]}} - C_{f_i} + C_{f_j}) \right] \mathbf{C}_{ij} R\end{aligned}$$

Alternative formulation \rightarrow more appropriate to match $I^{(12)} \epsilon$ poles

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbf{C}_{ij} RV &= \frac{\mathcal{N}_1}{s_{ij}} \left[P_{ij}^{\mu\nu} V_{\mu\nu}(\{k\}_{[ij]}) + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \Gamma_\epsilon \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \hat{P}_{ij}^{\mu\nu} B_{\mu\nu}(\{k\}_{[ij]}) \right] - \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\beta_0}{2\epsilon} \mathbf{C}_{ij} R \\ &\quad + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\Gamma_\epsilon}{\epsilon^2} \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \left[2 \mathbf{C}_{ij} R_{ij} - 2 \sum_{c \neq i,j} (F_i \mathbf{C}_{ij} R_{ic} + F_j \mathbf{C}_{ij} R_{jc}) \right]\end{aligned}$$

Corresponding barred limit

$$\begin{aligned}\bar{\mathbf{C}}_{ij} RV &\equiv \frac{\mathcal{N}_1}{s_{ij}} \left[P_{ij}^{\mu\nu} V_{\mu\nu}(\{\bar{k}\}^{(ijr)}) + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \Gamma_\epsilon \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \hat{P}_{ij}^{\mu\nu} B_{\mu\nu}(\{\bar{k}\}^{(ijr)}) \right] - \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\beta_0}{2\epsilon} \bar{\mathbf{C}}_{ij} R \\ &\quad + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\Gamma_\epsilon}{\epsilon^2} \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \left[2 \bar{\mathbf{C}}_{ij} R_{ij} - 2 \sum_{c \neq i,j} (\bar{F}_i^{(c)} \bar{\mathbf{C}}_{ij} R_{ic} + \bar{F}_j^{(c)} \bar{\mathbf{C}}_{ij} R_{jc}) \right]\end{aligned}$$

$$(RV - \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} RV) \mathcal{W}_{ij} = RV \mathcal{W}_{ij} - [\bar{\mathbf{S}}_i RV + \bar{\mathbf{C}}_{ij} (1 - \bar{\mathbf{S}}_i) RV] \mathcal{W}_{ij} = \text{finite}$$

Somogyi-Trócsányi
hep-ph: 0609043

Confirmed by
factorisation

The interesting case of $\mathbf{C}_{ij} RV$

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbf{C}_{ij} RV &= \frac{\mathcal{N}_1}{s_{ij}} \left[P_{ij}^{\mu\nu} V_{\mu\nu}(\{k\}_{[ij]}) + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \Gamma_\epsilon \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \hat{P}_{ij}^{\mu\nu} B_{\mu\nu}(\{k\}_{[ij]}) \right] - \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\beta_0}{2\epsilon} \mathbf{C}_{ij} R \\ &\quad + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\Gamma_\epsilon}{\epsilon^2} \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \left[C_{f_{[ij]}} - C_{f_i} - C_{f_j} + F_i (C_{f_{[ij]}} + C_{f_i} - C_{f_j}) + F_j (C_{f_{[ij]}} - C_{f_i} + C_{f_j}) \right] \mathbf{C}_{ij} R\end{aligned}$$

Alternative formulation \rightarrow more appropriate to match $I^{(12)} \epsilon$ poles

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbf{C}_{ij} RV &= \frac{\mathcal{N}_1}{s_{ij}} \left[P_{ij}^{\mu\nu} V_{\mu\nu}(\{k\}_{[ij]}) + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \Gamma_\epsilon \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \hat{P}_{ij}^{\mu\nu} B_{\mu\nu}(\{k\}_{[ij]}) \right] - \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\beta_0}{2\epsilon} \mathbf{C}_{ij} R \\ &\quad + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\Gamma_\epsilon}{\epsilon^2} \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \left[2 \mathbf{C}_{ij} R_{ij} - 2 \sum_{c \neq i,j} (F_i \mathbf{C}_{ij} R_{ic} + F_j \mathbf{C}_{ij} R_{jc}) \right]\end{aligned}$$

$$F_i = \epsilon \ln \frac{s_{ir}}{s_{ir} + s_{jr}} + \mathcal{O}(\epsilon^2) \quad \bar{F}_i^{(c)} = \epsilon \ln \frac{s_{ic}}{\bar{s}_{jc}^{(ijr)}} + \mathcal{O}(\epsilon^2)$$

$$\begin{aligned}\overline{\mathbf{C}}_{ij} RV &\equiv \frac{\mathcal{N}_1}{s_{ij}} \left[P_{ij}^{\mu\nu} V_{\mu\nu}(\{\bar{k}\}^{(ijr)}) + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \Gamma_\epsilon \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \hat{P}_{ij}^{\mu\nu} B_{\mu\nu}(\{\bar{k}\}^{(ijr)}) \right] - \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\beta_0}{2\epsilon} \overline{\mathbf{C}}_{ij} R \\ &\quad + \frac{\alpha_s}{2\pi} \frac{\Gamma_\epsilon}{\epsilon^2} \left(\frac{s_{ij}}{\mu^2} \right)^{-\epsilon} \left[2 \overline{\mathbf{C}}_{ij} R_{ij} - 2 \sum_{c \neq i,j} (\bar{F}_i^{(c)} \overline{\mathbf{C}}_{ij} R_{ic} + \bar{F}_j^{(c)} \overline{\mathbf{C}}_{ij} R_{jc}) \right]\end{aligned}$$

$$(RV - \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} RV) \mathcal{W}_{ij} = RV \mathcal{W}_{ij} - [\bar{\mathbf{S}}_i RV + \overline{\mathbf{C}}_{ij} (1 - \bar{\mathbf{S}}_i) RV] \mathcal{W}_{ij} = \text{finite}$$

Somogyi-Trócsányi
hep-ph: 0609043

Confirmed by
factorisation

Counterterm for RV

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} &= \int d\Phi_n \left(VV + I^{(2)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV + I^{(1)} \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} + \left(I^{(12)} - K^{(\mathbf{RV})} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} - K^{(1)} \delta_{X_{n+1}} - \left(K^{(2)} + K^{(12)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right]\end{aligned}$$

$$K^{(\mathbf{RV})} = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \left[\bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} RV + \Delta_{ij}^{\text{mapping}} \right] \mathcal{W}_{ij}$$

Counterterm for RV

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} &= \int d\Phi_n \left(VV + I^{(2)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV + I^{(1)} \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} + \left(I^{(12)} - K^{(\text{RV})} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} - K^{(1)} \delta_{X_{n+1}} - \left(K^{(2)} + K^{(12)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \end{aligned}$$

$$K^{(\text{RV})} = \sum_{i,j \neq i} \left[\bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} RV + \Delta_{ij}^{\text{mapping}} \right] \mathcal{W}_{ij}$$

We have verified analytically that

- $RV - K^{(\text{RV})} \rightarrow$ no IR singularities



done sector by sector

$$\mathbf{S}_i \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} RV = \mathbf{S}_i RV$$

$$\mathbf{S}_i \Delta_{ij}^{\text{mapping}} = 0$$

$$\mathbf{C}_{ij} \bar{\mathbf{L}}_{ij}^{(1)} RV = \mathbf{C}_{ij} RV$$

$$\mathbf{C}_{ij} \Delta_{ij}^{\text{mapping}} = 0$$

- $I^{(12)} - K^{(\text{RV})} \rightarrow$ no ϵ poles



Integrated counterterm for RV

$$\begin{aligned}\frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} &= \int d\Phi_n \left(VV + I^{(2)} + \boxed{I^{(\mathbf{RV})}} \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV + I^{(1)} \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} + \left(I^{(12)} - K^{(\mathbf{RV})} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} - K^{(1)} \delta_{X_{n+1}} - \left(K^{(2)} + K^{(12)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right]\end{aligned}$$

$$\boxed{I^{(\mathbf{RV})} = \int d\Phi_{\text{rad'}} K^{(\mathbf{RV})}}$$

Integrated counterterm for RV

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{d\sigma_{\text{NNLO}} - d\sigma_{\text{NLO}}}{dX} &= \int d\Phi_n \left(VV + I^{(2)} + \boxed{I^{(\text{RV})}} \right) \delta_{X_n} \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+1} \left[\left(RV + I^{(1)} \right) \delta_{X_{n+1}} + \left(I^{(12)} - K^{(\text{RV})} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \\ &\quad + \int d\Phi_{n+2} \left[RR \delta_{X_{n+2}} - K^{(1)} \delta_{X_{n+1}} - \left(K^{(2)} + K^{(12)} \right) \delta_{X_n} \right] \end{aligned}$$

$$\boxed{I^{(\text{RV})} = \int d\Phi_{\text{rad'}} K^{(\text{RV})}}$$

- Integration of $I^{(\text{RV})}$ feasible $I^{(\text{RV})} = I_s^{(\text{RV})} + I_{\text{hc}}^{(\text{RV})} + \boxed{I_{\text{mapping}}^{(\text{RV})}}$ ongoing
- Final check

$$\boxed{VV + I^{(2)} - I^{(\text{RV})} \rightarrow \text{no } \varepsilon \text{ poles}}$$

ongoing

State-of-the-art at NLO

- Initial and final state radiation in the massless case
- Dumping factors to improve convergence
- Final state radiation with massive particles

Ongoing:

- Numerical implementation
- Complete treatment of the massive cases

State-of-the-art at NNLO

massless final state radiation

- Verified cancellation of phase space singularities for RR and RV
- Verified cancellation of virtual singularities for RV

Ongoing:

- Verify cancellation of virtual singularities for VV

Outlook

- Initial state radiation at NNLO
- The massive case at NNLO

Thanks for your attention