

NNLL threshold resummation for the total top-pair production cross section

Christian Schwinn

— Univ. Freiburg —

14.10.2011

(Based on M.Beneke, P.Falgari, S. Klein, CS, arXiv:1109.1536 [hep-ph])



۸

1

Total cross section measurements at Tevatron and LHC

$$\begin{split} \Delta \sigma_{t\bar{t}} / \sigma_{tt} &\sim 7\% :\\ \sigma_{t\bar{t}}^{\mathsf{Tevatron}} = \begin{cases} 7.56^{+0.63}_{-0.56} & (\mathsf{D0}) \\ 7.50^{+0.48}_{-0.48} & (\mathsf{CDF}) \end{cases}\\ \sigma_{t\bar{t}}^{\mathsf{LHC} @7 \ \mathsf{TeV}} = \begin{cases} 165.8^{+13.3}_{-13.3} & (\mathsf{CMS}) \\ 179.0^{+11.8}_{-11.8} & (\mathsf{ATLAS}) \end{cases} \end{split}$$

NLO+NLL QCD:

(Nason, Dawson Ellis 88, Bonciani et al. 98)

 $\sigma_{t\bar{t}}^{\text{Tevatron}} = 6.93^{+0.28+0.51}_{-0.50-0.45}$ $\sigma_{t\bar{t}}^{\text{LHC @7 TeV}} = 167.1^{+14.3}_{-15}{}^{+13.9}_{-13}$

 \rightarrow Need higher-order predictions!



C. Schwinn

NNLL resummation for $t\bar{t}$ -production



NNLO: in progress, several ingredients known (Czakon et al.; Bonciani et al. 08-11; Körner et al. 05-09, Anastasiou/Mert-Aybert 08;...)

Progress for soft gluon resummation:

massive 2-loop IR singularities(Becher/Neubert; Ferroglia et al. 09)2-loop soft anomalous dimension

(Kidonakis; Mitov/Sterman/Sung; Beneke/Falgari/CS;Czakon Mitov/Sterman 09)

NNLO_{app.} (Moch/Uwer(Langenfeld) 08/09, Beneke et al.; Ahrens et al. 09, Kidonakis 10)

NNLL resummation (Ahrens et al. 10/11; Beneke et al. 11, Cacciari et al. 11)

Status of	of	NNLO _{approx}	<pre>c results</pre>
-----------	----	-------------------------------	----------------------

(Review: Kidonakis/Pecjak 11)





3

Soft corrections: (Resummation in Mellin space: Sterman 87; Catani, Trentadue 89, Kidonakis, Sterman 97, Bonciani et al. 98, ...) $\Rightarrow \alpha_s \ \log^2(8\beta^2)$ $\Rightarrow \alpha_s \log(8\beta^2)$

Coulomb gluon corrections (Fadin, Khoze 87; Peskin, Strassler 90, NRQCD,...)



Counting of threshold corrections:

$$\hat{\sigma}_{pp'} \propto \sigma^{(0)} \exp\left[\underbrace{\ln\beta g_0(\alpha_s \ln\beta)}_{(LL)} + \underbrace{g_1(\alpha_s \ln\beta)}_{(NLL)} + \underbrace{\alpha_s g_2(\alpha_s \ln\beta)}_{(NNLL)} + \ldots\right]$$

$$\times \sum_{k=0}^{k} \left(\frac{\alpha_s}{\beta}\right)^k \times \left\{1(LL, NLL); \alpha_s, \beta(NNLL); \ldots\right\}:$$



• Factorization into soft, hard and Coulomb functions

(Beneke, Falgari, CS 10)

$$\hat{\sigma}_{pp' \to HH'}|_{\hat{s} \to 4M^2} = \sum_{R,i} H_i W_i^R \otimes J^R$$

can include Coulomb resummation to all orders
 ((N)LO Coulomb-Green function: Fadin/Khoze 87; Beneke/Signer/Smirnov 99,...)



(frozen to $\mu_s \sim m_t \beta_{cut}^2$ for $\beta < \beta_{cut} = 0.35$ (Tevatron), 0.54 (LHC))



$\sigma_{t\bar{t}}[pb]$	Tevatron	LHC (7 TeV)	LHC (14 TeV)
NLO	$6.68^{+0.36+0.51}_{-0.75-0.45}$	$158.1^{+19.5+13.9}_{-21.2-13.1}$	$884^{+107+65}_{-106-58}$
NLL	$7.31^{+0.40+0.57}_{-0.54-0.54}$	$172.8^{+20.3+15.9}_{-15.5-14.6}$	$954^{+111}_{-76}{}^{+74}_{-66}$
NNLO _{app}	$7.06^{+0.27+0.69}_{-0.34-0.53}$	$161.1^{+12.3+15.2}_{-11.9-14.5}$	891^{+76+64}_{-69-63}
NNLL	$7.22^{+0.31+0.71}_{-0.47-0.55}$	$162.6^{+7.4+15.4}_{-7.6-14.7}$	896^{+40+65}_{-37-64}

(MSTW08PDFs, $m_t = 173.3$ GeV)

Different uncertainties for NNLL (added in quadrature above):

• Scale variation (μ_f, μ_h, μ_C) :

$$\Delta_{\mu}\sigma_{\mathsf{NNLL}}(\mathsf{TeV}) = \frac{+0.21}{-0.41} , \quad \Delta_{\mu}\sigma_{\mathsf{NNLL}}(\mathsf{LHC7}) = \frac{+4.2}{-1.9}$$

• Uncertainty in resummation procedure: (vary β_{cut} by 20%, envelope of various approximations, ambiguity $E \leftrightarrow m_t \beta^2$)

$$\Delta_{\mathsf{Res}}\sigma_{\mathsf{NNLL}}(\mathsf{TeV}) = \frac{+0.20}{-0.21} , \quad \Delta_{\mathsf{Res}}\sigma_{\mathsf{NNLL}}(\mathsf{LHC7}) = \frac{+3.9}{-5.6}$$

• Estimate of missing constant at $\mathcal{O}(\alpha_s^2)$

$$\Delta_{\text{Const}}\sigma_{\text{NNLL}}(\text{TeV}) = \pm 0.10$$
, $\Delta_{\text{Const}}\sigma_{\text{NNLL}}(\text{LHC7}) = \pm 4.7$



$\sigma_{t\bar{t}}[pb]$	Tevatron	LHC (7 TeV)	LHC (14 TeV)
NLO	$6.68^{+0.36+0.51}_{-0.75-0.45}$	$158.1^{+19.5+13.9}_{-21.2-13.1}$	$884^{+107+65}_{-106-58}$
NLL	$7.31^{+0.40+0.57}_{-0.54-0.54}$	$172.8^{+20.3+15.9}_{-15.5-14.6}$	$954^{+111}_{-76}{}^{+74}_{-66}$
NNLO _{app}	$7.06^{+0.27+0.69}_{-0.34-0.53}$	$161.1^{+12.3+15.2}_{-11.9-14.5}$	891^{+76+64}_{-69-63}
NNLL	$7.22^{+0.31+0.71}_{-0.47-0.55}$	$162.6^{+7.4+15.4}_{-7.6-14.7}$	896_{-37-64}^{+40+65}

(MSTW08PDFs, $m_t = 173.3 \text{ GeV}$)

NNLL results include

- Coulomb effects beyond NNLO
- bound-state corrections below threshold

(take $\Gamma_t \neq 0$ approximately into account)

 \Rightarrow small effect:

 $\Delta \sigma_{\sf BS} = 0.014 {\rm pb}$ (Tevatron), 0.67pb (LHC7), 3.1pb (LHC14) $\Delta \sigma_{\sf C} = -0.052 {\rm pb}$ (Tevatron), 0.13pb (LHC7), $-0.3 {\rm pb}$ (LHC14) 5



Fit m_t -dependence of NNLL-cross-section:

$$\sigma_{t\bar{t}}^{\text{th}}(m_{t}^{\text{pole}}) = \left(\frac{172.5}{m_{t}^{\text{pole}}}\right)^{4} \left(c_{0} + c_{1}(m_{t}^{\text{pole}} - 172.5) + c_{2}(m_{t}^{\text{pole}} - 172.5)^{2} + c_{3}(m_{t}^{\text{pole}} - 172.5)^{3}\right) \text{ pb},$$

$$c_{0} = 166.5, c_{1} = -1.15, c_{2} = 5.1 \times 10^{-3}, c_{3} = 8.5 \times 10^{-5}$$

$$\text{ATLAS-CONF-2011-121:} \qquad 260 \qquad \sigma_{t\bar{t}}^{\text{th}}(m_{t}) \qquad \sigma_{t\bar{t}}^{\text{th}} = 179.0 \pm 11.8 \text{ pb}$$
Dependence on m_{t}^{MC} :
$$\sigma_{t\bar{t}}^{\text{exp}}(m_{t}^{\text{MC}}) = \left(411.9 - 1.35 m_{t}^{\text{MC}}\right) \text{ pb}$$

$$\frac{180}{160}$$

maximize joined likelihood

$$f(m_t) = \int f_{\mathsf{th}}(\sigma|m_t) \cdot f_{\mathsf{exp}}(\sigma|m_t) d\sigma$$

with normalized Gaussians $f_{th/exp}$

$$\Rightarrow m_t^{\mathsf{pole}} = (169.8^{+5.2}_{-5.0}) \,\mathsf{GeV}$$



CMS result from $\sigma_{t\bar{t}} = 169.9 \pm 18.4$ pb:

Approx. NNLO × MSTW08NNLO	m_t^{pole} / GeV	$m_t^{\overline{\mathrm{MS}}}$ / GeV
Langenfeld et al. [7]	$170.3^{+7.3}_{-6.7}$	$163.1^{+6.8}_{-6.1}$
Kidonakis [8]	$170.0^{+7.6}_{-7.1}$	-
Ahrens et al. [9]	$167.6^{+7.6}_{-7.1}$	$159.8^{+7.3}_{-6.8}$

NNLL resummation for $t\bar{t}$ -production

$\sigma_{t\bar{t}}[pb]$	Tevatron	LHC (7 TeV)	
NLO	$6.68^{+0.36+0.51}_{-0.75-0.45}$	$158.1^{+19.5+13.9}_{-21.2-13.1}$	
NNLO _{app}	$7.06^{+0.27+0.69}_{-0.34-0.53}$	$161.1^{+12.3+15.2}_{-11.9-14.5}$	
NNLO _{app} +NNLL	$7.22^{+0.31+0.71}_{-0.47-0.55}$	$162.6^{+7.4+15.4}_{-7.6-14.7}$	(Beneke, Klein, Falgari, CS 11)
NLO+NNLL _N	$6.72^{+0.24+0.16}_{-0.41-0.12}$	$158.7^{+12.2+4.3}_{-13.5-4.4}$	(Cacciari et al. 11)

Mellin space:
$$(\rho = 4m_t^2/\hat{s})$$

(Sterman 87; Catani, Trentadue 89)

$$\sigma^{N} = \int_{0}^{1} d\rho \rho^{N-1} \hat{\sigma}(4m_{t}^{2}/\rho) , \quad \int_{0}^{1} d\rho \rho^{N} \beta \log^{n} \beta \propto \ln^{n} N + \dots$$

log *N*-terms exponentiate: $\hat{\sigma}^N / \hat{\sigma}^{(0)N} = g^0 \exp \left(G^{N+1}(m_t^2, \mu^2) \right)$ Inverse numerical transformation (Catani, Mangano, Nason, Trentadue 96)



$\sigma_{t\bar{t}}[pb]$	Tevatron	LHC (7 TeV)	
NLO	$6.68^{+0.36+0.51}_{-0.75-0.45}$	$158.1^{+19.5+13.9}_{-21.2-13.1}$	
NNLO _{app}	$7.06^{+0.27+0.69}_{-0.34-0.53}$	$161.1^{+12.3+15.2}_{-11.9-14.5}$	
NNLO _{app} +NNLL	$7.22^{+0.31+0.71}_{-0.47-0.55}$	$162.6^{+7.4+15.4}_{-7.6-14.7}$	(Beneke, Klein, Falgari, CS 11)
NLO+NNLL _N	$6.72^{+0.24+0.16}_{-0.41-0.12}$	$158.7^{+12.2+4.3}_{-13.5-4.4}$	(Cacciari et al. 11)

Ambiguities in N-space results

(Cacciari et al. 11)

• $\mathcal{O}(\alpha_s^2)$ constant in threshold expansion from Mellin transform

 $\Delta \sigma_{tt} = 0.25 \text{ pb (TeV)}, 9.2 \text{ pb (LHC 7TeV)}$

- 1/N suppressed terms $\sim \left(1 \frac{A}{A+N-1}\right)$ in NLO g_0 , take A = 0, 2 $\Delta \sigma_{tt} = 0.12$ pb (TeV), 6 pb (LHC 7TeV)
- Matching to NLO or NNLO_{app}: affects 1/N terms at NNLO



Resummation for differential cross sections

Pair invariant mass cross sections

(Kidonakis, Sterman 97, Ahrens et al. 10)

$$\frac{d\hat{\sigma}(t\bar{t})}{dM_{t\bar{t}}} \quad \Rightarrow \left[\frac{\log^n(1-z)}{1-z}\right]_+ , \ z = \frac{M_{t\bar{t}}^2}{\hat{s}} , \qquad \mathsf{PIM}_{\mathsf{SCET}} : \log\left(\frac{1-z}{\sqrt{z}}\right) + \frac{1-z}{\sqrt{z}} = \frac{M_{t\bar{t}}^2}{\hat{s}}$$

One particle inclusive cross sections:

(Laenen et al. 98, Ahrens et al. 11)

$$\frac{d\hat{\sigma}(t+X)}{ds_4} \quad \Rightarrow \left[\frac{\log^n\left(s_4/m^2\right)}{s_4}\right]_+; \ s_4 = p_X^2 - m_t^2 \ , \quad 1\mathsf{PI}_{\mathsf{SCET}} : \log\left(s_4/\sqrt{m^2 + s_4}\right)$$



NNLL resummation for $t\bar{t}$ -production



Comparison to other NNLO _{app} predictions:			(from Pejack/Kidonakis 11)
		Tevatron	LHC (7 TeV)
NLO		$6.74^{+0.36}_{-0.76}$	160^{+20}_{-21}
$NNLO^eta_{app}$	[HATHOR]	$7.13\substack{+0.31 \\ -0.39}$	164^{+3}_{-9}
$NNLO_{app}^{1Pl}$	[Kidonakis]	$7.08\substack{+0.00 \\ -0.24}$	163^{+7}_{-5}
NNLO ^{1PI/PIM SCET}	[Ahrens et al.]	$6.65\substack{+0.08 \\ -0.41}$	156^{+8}_{-9}
$NNLL^{eta}$	[This work]	$7.29^{+0.31}_{-0.47}$	164^{+8}_{-8}
$(m_t = 173, PDF + lpha_s$ uncertainties not shown)			



C. Schwinn

NNLL resummation for $t\bar{t}$ -production



Threshold corrections $\sim \log^n \beta$, $\frac{1}{\beta^n}$

- Factorization of soft and Coulomb corrections
- $\log \beta$ resummation from momentum space solution to RGEs
- combined Soft and Coulomb resummation possible

NNLL resummation for $t\bar{t}$

• Estimate of residual uncertainty

kinematic ambiguities, uncertainties in resummation procedure

- small effects beyond NNLO (2 % Tevatron, 1 % LHC)
- theory uncertainty +4.2/-6.5% Tevatron, $\pm4.5\%$ LHC (PDF+ α_s uncertainty larger)

Mass determination from $\sigma_{t\bar{t}}$:

$$\Delta m_t \approx \pm 5 \,\, \mathrm{GeV}$$

appears viable

(Ahrens et al. 10/11)



11



Top-pair production: two LO subprocesses:



• $q\bar{q}$ channel: colour octet, spin triplet

$$\hat{\sigma}_{q\bar{q}}^{(8)} = \frac{\pi\beta}{9m_t^2} \left[1 + \frac{\alpha_s}{4\pi} \left(\frac{-2\pi^2}{2N_c} \frac{1}{\beta} + 8C_F \log^2 8\beta^2 - (32C_F + 4N_C) \log 8\beta^2 \right) + \dots \right]$$

• gg channel: colour singlet/octet, spin singlet

$$\hat{\sigma}_{gg}^{(1)} = \frac{5\pi\beta}{192m_t^2} \left[1 + \frac{\alpha_s}{4\pi} \left(2C_F \pi^2 \frac{1}{\beta} + 8N_C \log^2 8\beta^2 - 32N_C \log 8\beta^2 \right) + \dots \right]$$
$$\hat{\sigma}_{gg}^{(8)} = \frac{\pi\beta}{96m_t^2} \left[1 + \frac{\alpha_s}{4\pi} \left(\frac{-2\pi^2}{2N_C} \frac{1}{\beta} + 8N_C \log^2 8\beta^2 - (32N_C + 4N_C) \log 8\beta^2 \right) + \dots \right]$$

 \Rightarrow Universal behaviour depending on initial/final colour states

C. Schwinn

NNLL resummation for $t\bar{t}$ -production







 \Rightarrow large ambiguities, but exact result covered: ($\mu_f = \mu_r = m_t = 173.1 \text{ GeV}$)

$$\sigma_{\text{NLO,app}}(\text{Tev}) = 6.42 - 7.45 \text{pb} \qquad \sigma_{\text{NLO}}(\text{Tev}) = 6.50 \text{pb}$$

$$\sigma_{\text{NLO,app}}(\text{LHC7}) = 130 - 158 \text{ pb} \qquad \sigma_{\text{NLO}}(\text{LHC7}) = 150 \text{ pb}$$

NNLL resummation for *tt*-production



Coulomb resummation

in Coulomb Green function:

(Fadin, Khoze 87; Peskin, Strassler 90)

$$\hat{\sigma}_{t\bar{t}}(\hat{s}) \sim \sum_{R=1,8} \sigma_{t\bar{t}}^{0,R}(\hat{s}) \operatorname{Im} G_{\mathrm{C}}^{R}(0,0;E+i\Gamma)$$

Singlet channel, neglecting decay width:

$$\operatorname{Im} G_{\mathcal{C}}^{1}(0,0;E) = \begin{cases} \frac{-m_{t}^{2}\pi C_{F}\alpha_{s}}{4\pi} \left(e^{-\pi C_{F}\alpha_{s}}\sqrt{\frac{m_{t}}{E}}-1\right)^{-1} & E > 0\\ \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \delta(E-E_{n})R_{n} & E < 0 \end{cases}$$

$$E = \sqrt{\hat{s} - 2m_t} \approx m_t \beta^2$$

Bound-state poles at

$$E_n = -\frac{\alpha_s^2 C_F^2 m_t}{4n^2}$$

smeared out by $\Gamma_t \neq 0$.



C. Schwinn



Hadron collider cross sections from QCD factorization

(Collins, Soper, Sterman)

$$\sigma_{NN'}(s) = \sum_{pp'} \int dx_1 dx_2 \ f_{N/p}(x_1,\mu_f) f_{N'/p'}(x_2,\mu_f) \ \hat{\sigma}_{pp'}(sx_1x_2,\mu_f)$$

- $\hat{\sigma}_{pp'}$: partonic cross section: compute in perturbation theory
- $f_{p/N}(x)$: Parton distribution function for parton p in hadron N:

PDF uncertainties for top:







$$\begin{split} & \mathsf{Expand \ NNLL \ to \ } \mathcal{O}(\alpha_s^3), \ \mathsf{e.g.} \\ & \Delta \sigma_{qq,\mathsf{NNLL}}^{(3)} = & 12945.4 \log^6 \beta - 37369.1 \log^5 \beta + 27721.4 \log^4 \beta + 41839.4 \log^3 \beta \\ & \quad + \frac{1}{\beta} \left(-6278.5 \log \beta + 3862.5 \log^2 \beta + 2804.7 \log^3 \beta - 2994.5 \log^4 \beta \right) \\ & \quad + \frac{153.9 \log^2 \beta + 122.9 \log \beta - 145}{\beta^2} + \underbrace{\left\{ \log \beta^{1,2}, 1/\beta, C^{(3)} \right\}}_{\mathsf{not \ known \ exactly}} + \mathsf{scale \ dep.} \end{split}$$

N³LO_A: keep all terms, including k-dependence and constants N³LO_B: only keep terms known exactly



C. Schwinn

NNLL resummation for $t\bar{t}$ -production



RGE approach: fixed μ_s that minimizes soft corrections to hadronic σ (Becher, Neubert, Xu 07)

Application to $t\bar{t}$:

• ambiguities in soft scale from minimising $\sigma_{soft}^{NLO}(\mu)$ (e.g. LHC7):

 $\mu_s = 58 \text{GeV} \quad (\log m_t \beta^2 / \mu) \Leftrightarrow \quad \mu_s = 99 \text{GeV} \quad (\log E / \mu = \log(\sqrt{\hat{s}} - 2m_t) / \mu)$

• does resum logarithms on avarage; appropriate for $<\beta>\approx 0.5$?

$\sigma_{tar{t}}$	Tevatron	LHC (7 TeV)	LHC (14 TeV)
NLO	$6.68\substack{+0.36 \\ -0.75}$	$158.1^{+19.5}_{-21.2}$	884^{+107}_{-106}
NLL	$6.90^{+0.32}_{-0.41}$	$157.6^{+23.3}_{-20.2}$	876^{+136}_{-113}
NNLO _{app}	$7.06^{+0.25}_{-0.33}$	$161.1^{+11.4}_{-10.9}$	891^{+71}_{-63}
NNLL	$7.08^{+0.17}_{-0.28}$	$157.4^{+10.3}_{-3.6}$	868^{+69}_{-21}

(MSTW08PDFs, $m_t = 173.3$ GeV, PDF+ α_s -uncertainty not included,

(N)NLL error includes μ_h/μ_f , μ_s , μ_C variation, $m_t\beta^2 \leftrightarrow \sqrt{s} - 2m_t$ difference)



Soft scale choice in momentum-space resummation

- RGE approach: fixed μ_s , vary by 0.5...2 (Becher, Neubert, Xu 07)
- Running scale with cutoff

(Beneke, Falgari, Klein, CS 11)

$$\mu_s \sim \begin{cases} m_t \beta_{\mathsf{cut}}^2, & \mathsf{for}\beta < \beta_{\mathsf{cut}} \\ m_t \beta^2, & \mathsf{for}\beta > \beta_{\mathsf{cut}} \end{cases}$$

 $\mathcal{O}(\alpha_s^2)$ constant in threshold expansion

$$\Delta \sigma_{tt}^{(2)}(7\text{TeV}) = \left[1.70 \left(\frac{C_{qq}^{(2)}}{1000}\right) + 4.31 \left(\frac{C_{gg,8}^{(2)}}{1000}\right) + 1.31 \left(\frac{C_{gg,1}^{(2)}}{1000}\right)\right] \text{pb}$$

Estimate

$$C_2 \approx C_1^2$$
: $\Delta \sigma_{tt}^{(2)} \sim \pm 5 \text{ pb}$

Kinematic ambiguity

$$\log \beta \Leftrightarrow \log((\sqrt{\hat{s}} - 2m_t)/m_t): \quad \Delta \sigma_{tt} \sim 1 \text{ pb}$$



Running scale: Introduce β_{cut}

- allow for different implementations
 - $\beta < \beta_{cut}$: NNLL ($\mu_s = k_s m_t \beta_{cut}^2$) with/without constant at $\mathcal{O}(\alpha_s^2)$ $\beta > \beta_{cut}$: NNLL ($\mu_s = k_s m_t \beta^2$); NNLO_{approx}; NNNL₃(A/B)



- Choose β_{cut} so that not too sensitive to
 - ambiguities for $\beta \to 1$
 - breakdown of perturbation theory for $\beta \rightarrow 0$

(E.g. LHC7: $\mu_s = 2m_t\beta^2$, $\beta_{cut} = 0.54 \Rightarrow \mu_s > 100$ GeV)